

# REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

## 11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in November 1996 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

# PRINCIPAL AUSTRALIAN HISTORIC THEME(S)

• 4.1.2 Making suburbs

• 4.6 Remembering significant phases in the development

settlements, towns and cities

## HERITAGE COUNCIL OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA THEME(S)

• 107 Settlements

# 11. 1 AESTHETIC VALUE\*

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park is a fine example of the Inter-War Old English architectural style applied to a residence, demonstrating a skilled level of design excellence in its massing, its use of materials and the high quality of interior spaces, featuring dark timbered ceilings with plater infill panels, timber plank doors with ornate door hinges, exposed brick entrance hall and fireplaces with decorative brick with timber mantle. (Criterion 1.2)

## 11. 2. HISTORIC VALUE

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park is associated with development of architect-designed homes for wealthy clients moving into Mosman Park to take advantage of the river views during the inter-war period. (Criterion 2.2)

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park was designed for Perth Radiologist W Frayne by Reginald Summerhayes, a prominent architect of the inter-war period who is responsible for a number of landmark buildings in Perth. (Criterion 2.3)

## 11. 3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

-----

.

For consistency, all references to architectural style are taken from Apperly, R., Irving, R., Reynolds, P. *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture. Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present,* Angus and Robertson, North Ryde, 1989.

For consistency, all references to garden and landscape types and styles are taken from Ramsay, J. *Parks, Gardens and Special Trees: A Classification and Assessment Method for the Register of the National Estate,* Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra, 1991, with additional reference to Richards, O. *Theoretical Framework for Designed Landscapes in WA*, unpublished report, 1997.

## 11. 4. SOCIAL VALUE

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park's architecture and association with the transformation of Mosman Park is part of the cultural landscape that contributes to Mosman Park's sense of place. (Criterion 4.2)

## 12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

## 12. 1. RARITY

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park has moderate rarity as an example of the work of Edwin/Reginald Summerhayes. (Criterion 5.2)

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park is rare as a fine example of the Inter-War Old English architectural style. (Criterion 5.2)

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park is rare as an example of the Inter-War Old English architectural style applied to a residence. (Criterion 5.2)

## 12. 2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park demonstrates the principal characteristics of Inter-War Old English architecture. (Criterion 6.1)

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park demonstrates the development of Mosman Park from a working class to affluent town. (Criterion 6.1)

## 12. 3 CONDITION

Generally the place is in good condition. There are sections of the roof that are in fair condition with some tiles dislodged and others showing signs of deterioration. Some sections of the ceiling to the first floor have minor cracking and there is also evidence of water ingress.

## 12. 4 INTEGRITY

The place has high integrity. The place was built as a residence and it continues to be used for its original function. The original intent of the various rooms is still clearly evident.

## 12. 5 AUTHENTICITY

The place has high authenticity. Most of the original fabric remains and changes have mostly been made to facilitate the ongoing use of the place as a residence. Changes have occurred to utility spaces such as kitchen, bathrooms and laundry.

## 13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

The documentation for this place is based on the physical evidence completed by Stephen Carrick Architects Pty Ltd, in May 2014, with documentary evidence, assessment amendments and/or additions by the State Heritage Office and the Register Committee.

## 13. 1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

When settled by the British in 1833, the Mosman Park area was originally known as 'Buckland Downs,' which was divided into a number of land grants for small scale farming. Early access to Perth was via ferry services and a dirt track through what is now Peppermint Grove, but the introduction of convicts in the 1850s saw the development of the convict-built Perth-Fremantle Road. By 1881, this was augmented with the establishment of the Perth-Fremantle railway, which accelerated the pattern of development in the district.

This growth was further accelerated between 1890-1910 by the discoveries of gold in Western Australia's interior, this new source of wealth seeing the development of the Perth area shift from farming to a combination of residential areas and associated services.<sup>4</sup> During this period, Mosman Park was named 'Buckland Hill' (although it was also known as 'Cottesloe' and 'Peppermint Grove'), and the area was known as a working-class suburb and after 1915 a settlement for war-service homes.<sup>5</sup> The suburb had an industrial presence, with the area home to a superphosphate works, engineering works, rope works, a sugar refinery, as well as numerous sites of Lime quarrying and Lime burning.<sup>6</sup> This period also saw the establishment of the Buckland Hill Road Board in 1899.<sup>7</sup>

This industrial expansion continued into the 1920s with the opening of a General Motors factory in 1926, and residential infrastructure development included the shift from private to state electricity supply in 1924 and a water reservoir in 1925.8 However as land overlooking the Swan River began to be developed, the blocks established there commanded a high price, the homes built upon them tending to be timber framed residences of a high quality.9

These demographic and infrastructure changes were eventually felt at Swan Locations 82 and 83, which in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century had been a small farming bock owned by the Samson family. 'Samson's Paddock' was vacant save a stone

\_

Town of Mosman Park Municipal Inventory, (Town of Mosman Park:1998), p. 16; H Downey, Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1971), p. 15-19

H Downey, Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1971), p. 20

E Tuettemann, Between River and Sea: A History of Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1991), p. 16-18

H Downey, Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1971), p. 28-30; E Tuettemann, Between River and Sea: A History of Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1991), p. 17-24, 30-33

Worker's Homes,' *The West* Australian, 4 February 1915, p. 8; E Tuettemann, *Between River and Sea: A History of Mosman Park, Western Australia*, (Town of Mosman Park:1991), p. 17-24, 62-63;

The Daily News, 3 November 1910, p. 8; Sunday Times, 11 May 1902, p. 7; 'Fremantle Harbour Works,' The West Australian, 17 November 1892, p. 2; 'Quarrying and Lime Burning,' The Daily News, 9 October 1897, p. 5; Western Australian Post Office Directory, 1899

<sup>7</sup> Town of Mosman Park Municipal Inventory, (Town of Mosman Park:1998), p. 17

General Motors' New Plant, 'Sunday Times 21 November 1926, p. 27; 'A Better Water Supply,' Western Mail, 21 May 1925, p. 7; 'Cottesloe Municipality,' The West Australian, 2 May 1924, p. 8

H Downey, Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1971), p. 33

caretaker's cottage, which in 1917 was inhabited by the Norrish family. <sup>10</sup> However in 1920 the locations were subdivided for sale and re-named 'Samson's Estate.' A total of 60 lots were created, the land prices ranging from £200 to £300 depending on proximity to the river or Bay View Terrace. The land was advertised as having access to a water supply, electricity, telephone and macadamised roads. <sup>11</sup>

The lots in Samson's Estate became home to particularly expensive residences; the values of homes constructed in this area quoted as part of published building permits between 1920-1935 were often twice as expensive (or more) than other suburbs. Mosman Park was therefore becoming a suburb of extremes during the Depression years, with the development of relatively expensive homes overlooking the river occurring alongside homelessness and the inability to sell cheaper blocks of land further inland towards the Perth-Fremantle Road (now Stirling Highway). In response to the widespread poverty of the Depression years, a particularly large jump in the number of new buildings occurred between 1933 and 1935 as part of the government's Building Revival Campaign. Another notable development in Buckland Hill during this time was the establishment of St. Hilda's Anglican School for Girls along Bay View Terrace in 1931.

It was in this context of early 1930s development that Dr W F Frayne established House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park. Dr Frayne was recorded as working as a radiologist at Perth Hospital in early 1922 and working at St. John's Hospital in the 1930s. 16 Dr Frayne was first listed in the Western Australian Post Office Directory in 1923 as a radiologist at Perth Hospital, but after not being listed between 1924 and 1929, is then listed in 1930 as a medical professional working at a private practice on St. George's Terrace, Perth.<sup>17</sup> During this period Dr Frayne also worked for the West Australian Cancer Trust, working to develop a medical research council for cancer studies. 18 Dr Frayne had been living in Keane Street, Peppermint Grove, however in 1933 chose to build a new house in Hill Terrace, Buckland Hill, the building permit for which advertised the proposal as a as 'brick residence, Hill-terrace,' costing £2786. The building was completed in 1934, and address given in the Western Australian Post Office Directory as 'Bay View Terrace at Hill Terrace'. Dr Frayne was then listed in the phone and postal directories 1934 as a Medical professional working at a radiology practice at Chennell House in St George's Terrace with Dr Smith, while his residence was

E Tuettemann, Between River and Sea: A History of Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1991), p. 16, 58

H Downey, *Mosman Park, Western Australia*, (Town of Mosman Park:1971), plate 14; *The Daily News*, 22 March 1920, p. 4

<sup>12 &#</sup>x27;Real Estate,' Sunday Times, 29 April 1928, p. 4; 'Real Estate,' Sunday Times, 18 March 1934, p. 7; 'Real Estate,' Sunday Times, 12 March 1933, p. 5; 'Real Estate,' Sunday Times, 7 January 1934, p. 12; 'Real Estate,' Sunday Times, 5 November 1933, p. 5

E Tuettemann, Between River and Sea: A History of Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1991), p. 60, 79, 177

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Striking Revival in Building Trade,' The Daily News, 13 May 1935, p. 6; 'Great Revival in Building,' The Daily News, 3 August 1934, p. 1, 5

<sup>15 &#</sup>x27;Property Sales,' *The West Australian*, 5 April 1930, p. 6; 'Real Estate,' *The West Australian*, 17 January 1931, p. 10

 <sup>&#</sup>x27;Social Notes,' The West Australian, 12 August 1922, p. 12; The Daily News, 1930, p. 10; Sunday Times,
 January 1937, p. 13; 'Perth Hospital,' The West Australian, 13 May 1938, p. 16

Western Australian Post Office Directory, 1923, p. 675; Western Australian Post Office Directory, 1930,
 p. 831

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> 'Treating Cancer,' *The West Australian*, 15 May 1936, p. 24

listed separately.<sup>19</sup> Given that doctor's homes could double as private surgeries, complete with separate entrances, it is possible that patients were received at a private surgery in House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park. However, this is not positively confirmed by the documentary or physical evidence.<sup>20</sup>

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park was designed by the architectural firm E Summerhayes and Son, the established practitioner Edwin joined by his son Reginald, who had returned from Singapore in 1926. As the newest generation of an established name, Reginald Summerhayes had become an influential member of his profession, serving as the Secretary of the Royal Institute of Architects of Western Australia from 1931-1934, going on to serve as their president in 1927 and 1938.<sup>21</sup> Reginald lobbied for more wooden homes in suburbs, donating money for a building campaign.<sup>22</sup> He was also the winner of the Wooden Model Homes competition, part of the Building Revival Campaign of 1933.<sup>23</sup> This campaign was a success, with a number of new homes opened in March 1934.<sup>24</sup>

Reginald's projects during the 1930s were a mix of commercial, industrial and residential, although the effects of the Great Depression were felt by the firm and it was not until the late 1930s that business picked up. Despite this, Reginald demonstrated a number of architectural styles in his work, including Art Deco and 'mock Tudor,' or Inter-War Old English.<sup>25</sup>

Inter-War Old English as an architectural style was an attempt to recapture an idyllic English past, a cultural movement that had previously taken place in the Federation Queen Anne style popularised by the work of Englishman Richard Shaw.<sup>26</sup> Following the horrors of the First World War, this return to traditional English styles re-emerged not just as a retreat to the past but as a rejection of purely functionalist modern style or designs that 'inappropriately' mixed architectural traditions. In Domestic Architecture in Australia (1919), South Australian architect William Bagot made an impassioned plea for Old English architectural traditions, stating 'What matter if the object is a copy of yesterday, so long as it is a perfect reproduction of a worthy model?'27 Bagot goes on to note the 'racial traditions' of English architecture, the importance of landscaped gardens and the opportunities of the traditional Mediterranean styles in the Australian climate.

<sup>19</sup> Western Australian Post Office Directory, 1933, p. 135, 501; 'This Week's Permits,' The West Australian, 11 March 1933, p. 6; Western Australian Post Office Directory 1934, p. 131, 788; Perth Telephone Directory, Commonwealth of Australia, 1934, p. 49

<sup>20</sup> For examples of this practise see P10120 Doctor's House (fmr), Norseman (RHP), which was built in 1939, and P18921 Doctor's Residence & Surgery, Northam, built in 1900.

<sup>21</sup> G Summerhayes, Summerhayes: Three generations of architects in Western Australia, 2010, Appendix

<sup>22</sup> 'Institute of Architects,' The West Australian, 31 March 1934, p. 6; 'Wooden houses,' The West Australian, 11 August 1933; 'Building Revival,' The West Australian, 30 August 1933, p. 10; see also assessment documentation P8895 Model Timber Home (RHP)

<sup>23</sup> 'Model Homes,' The Daily News, 4 October 1933, p. 5

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Model Homes,' The West Australian, 29 March 1934, p. 18

<sup>25</sup> G Summerhayes, Summerhayes: Three generations of architects in Western Australia, 2010, p. 38-45

R., Irving, R., Reynolds, P. A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture. Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present, Angus and Robertson, North Ryde, 1989, p. 132, 202

W Bagot 'A Plea for Tradition,' Domestic Architecture in Australia, U Smith, B Stevens, W H Wilson (eds.), 1919, p. 25-29

While the motivation of Inter-War Old English was return to rural simplicity the style was popular among Australia's wealthy; leading to the paradox of a quaint Tudor cottage as a demonstration of wealth and class.

In his personal recollections of *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park*, Geoffrey Summerhayes (Edwin's son) noted that the building's exterior clinker bricks were considered reject bricks at the time, and as such were cheap to build with. The interior of the house was kept to an Arts and Crafts tradition:

The ceilings had dark adzed jarrah beams, the doors were made of three planks of polished jarrah reinforced with large wrought iron decorative strap hinges and door latches. The hall walls were in clinker bricks as were those around the fireplaces with thick jarrah mantles mellowed by years of polish. The bathroom had yellow and green tiles with a yellow terrazzo floor with green inset stripes as a border with the mirror set into an arched recess. The verandah floors were in jarrah boards and the facades of the building had decorative window-boxes under the windows as was common in most of (Reginald Summerhayes) house designs of the early 1930s.<sup>28</sup>

After a series of name changes Buckland Hill became known as Mosman Park in 1937.<sup>29</sup>

In 1947 Frayne moved from *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park.* Rather than selling the place, Dr Frayne instead performed a swap with stock feed merchant David D Gray 1947, taking Gray's residence in *Lawson Flats* apartments in Perth, while the Gray family assumed ownership of *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park*.<sup>30</sup>

David Gray founded David Gray and Co. in 1939, establishing offices and a laboratory in West Perth. While the company's first products were stock foods they later branched out into agricultural chemicals, partly due to an outbreak of Argentinian ants that plagued Western Australia in the 1940s.<sup>31</sup> The David Gray company continues to operate as a home garden products supplier, managed by David Gray Jnr who still has early memories of *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park.*<sup>32</sup>

The residential landscape of Mosman Park continued to grow during the post-war period, seeing the establishment of larger, architect-designed homes that took advantage of the river views offered in the area.<sup>33</sup> Paradoxically, Mosman Park also developed more homes for poorer families under the Commonwealth-State rental homes scheme, as well as developing residential flats.<sup>34</sup> This system was based on a demarcation system employed by the Mosman Park Road Board where differently valued areas of Mosman Park had different minimum house

\_

G Summerhayes, Summerhayes: Three generations of architects in Western Australia, 2010, p. 38-45-46

Town of Mosman Park Municipal Inventory, (Town of Mosman Park:1998), p. 20

Western Australian Post Office Directory, 1947, p. 126; P2092 Lawson Flats (RHP)

<sup>&#</sup>x27;David Gray and Co,' Confederation Report, June 1989, p. 8; West Australian, 22 Jun 1940, p.3; Western Mail, 27 August 1953 p.70; 'Combating Ants,' The West Australian, 12 March 1948, p. 6

Pers.comm. David Gray jnr, 5/7/2013.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Architecture and Real Estate', *The West Australian*, 19 June 1954, p. 16; 'Land in the suburbs brings high prices,' *The West Australian*, 19 October 1954, p. 31; 'New design with a view,' *Sunday Times*, 22 March 1953, p. 16; 'New Homes at Mon Repos,' *The West Australian*, 19 June 1954, p. 16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> 'Houses built on Former Searchlight Area,' *The West Australian*, 15 May 1950, p. 11; 'Mosman Park to Review Flats Policy,' 16 July 1954, p. 15; E Tuettemann, *Between River and Sea: A History of Mosman Park, Western Australia*, (Town of Mosman Park:1991), p. 62-65

costs permitted.<sup>35</sup> The influx of professionals who built larger riverside homes accelerated in the 1960s and 1980s.<sup>36</sup>

In 1972 Gray made two changes to the property. The first was the addition of a 7.5 m by 6.4 m brick garage, adjacent to the southeast corner of the house. The second was a swimming pool, designed by John Connell & Associates, constructed of concrete block walls with a water-proof membrane and cement render, placed in the southeast corner of the block.<sup>37</sup>

More significant changes to the structure of *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park* took place in 1978, with additions and alterations to the southern end of the house. Plans indicate that a section of the southern roof was demolished and rebuilt over the laundry, toilet, rear entrance and 'boiler room.' A number of repairs and changes, including modifying internal walls, were made to the laundry. A new family room was added to the southern face of the house that connected to the kitchen, with a new set of double doors leading out into the back garden. The designers, Hawkin & Allan Architects, took a great deal of care to respect Summerhayes' original design, making a specific point of saving and re-using shingles and bricks, and matching new face bricks as much as possible to the originals.<sup>38</sup>

By 1992 the house was no longer owned by the Gray family. Further alterations were made to the kitchen area in 2003, including new cupboards and bench tops, as well as shifting the position of the oven. Changes were also made to the structural support between the kitchen and dining room and along the southern wall, removing the brickwork and replacing existing concrete beams with a composite steel beam.<sup>39</sup>

Images of the residence from 1934 compared to images taken in 2014 show no significant external changes to *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park*, although the boundary fence has been replaced with a low brick wall and hedge. A number of newer garden plantings are also apparent.<sup>40</sup>

#### 13. 2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

Streetscape

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park, is located on the corner of Hill Terrace and Bay View Terrace. The site is on the east side of Bay View Terrace with Hawley Lane forming the southern boundary.

Hill Terrace landform slopes from a high at Bay View Terrace to Johnson Parade, which is adjacent to the Swan River. Hill Terrace streetscape is comprised of 2 storey residential buildings with mature street trees. Common materials are face brick and painted rendered walls with hip and gable tile roofs. Most residences have low front fences with well-maintained gardens contributing to the high quality streetscape.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;House Building,' The West Australian, 13 March 1946, p. 4

E Tuettemann, Between River and Sea: A History of Mosman Park, Western Australia, (Town of Mosman Park:1991), p. 56, 110

Notes from property file held by the City of Mosman Park

<sup>38</sup> Ibid.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid

Illustrations Ltd., 'House possibly designed or lived in by R. Summerhayes Esp. [picture],' 1934, State Library of Western Australia 102337PD & 192338PD; Google Maps, https://maps.google.com.au/

Adjacent development to the subject site in Bay View Terrace includes St Hilda's School, which is set well back from the street, and a contemporary 2 storey, flat roof, residential development. Bay View Terrace carries moderate vehicular traffic and Hill Terrace has a lower volume of traffic.

### Site and External

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park, is designed in the Inter-War Old English architectural style. This style has the broad characteristics of having the visually prominent attributes of traditional English rural and village architecture. The style features vertical proportions, picturesque asymmetry, tall brick chimneys and imitation half-timbering used in gables and upper storeys. The main interior spaces often feature the Old English theme with the use of timber panelling and dark timber joinery. Reginald Summerhays is recognised as a key practitioner of this architectural style.

The site is rectangular in shape and orientated north-south. There is a considerable cross fall from a high point on the west boundary to a low point on the eastern boundary. The residence is located close to the west boundary and there are three main external spaces, being the front yard, driveway to the east and rear yard to the south.

The front yard to the north has a lawn terrace bordered by a high manicured hedge to the boundary and a low hedge adjacent to the eastern driveway. A brick path leads from the driveway to the verandah. The terrace is screened to the west by a curved brick wall with an arched opening, this original element standing in contrast to the strong lines of the larger structure.<sup>41</sup>

The area to the east of the residence has a brick paved and concrete driveway that leads to a two car, flat roofed garage. There is a low hedge and shrubs, along with a mature tree, bordering the drive. A brick fence covered by a creeper defines the east boundary.

The rear yard is divided into two sections, an upper and lower terrace. The upper terrace comprises a paved area, adjacent to the residence, with a steel framed pergola and a level grass area. The pergola is covered with a creeper. The lawn is bordered by a low stone retaining wall that forms the edge to a raised garden containing shrubs and mature trees. The lower terrace is accessed by four stone steps and bordered by a stone retaining wall and a brick wall, likely installed in the 1970s with the pool. The terrace has an in ground pool and at the northern end of the pool there is a gate and further steps that leads to the eastern driveway.

House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park, address the corner location with two dominant picturesque elevations. The west elevation to Bay View Terrace contains the main entry, defined by an entry porch and large gable, and a single garage with a projecting gable roof. The north elevation has two large gable roofs, with the ground floor gable roof extending over a deep verandah. The corner location is further addressed by a high hedge curving along the boundary line to the west and north.

See also a 1934 photo of the place; Illustrations Ltd 'House possibly designed or lived in by R. Summerhayes Esq. [picture],' State Library of Western Australia online catalogue, accessed 12 May 2014.

http://catalogue.slwa.wa.gov.au/search~S2?/c102337PD/c102337pd/-3%2C-1%2C0%2CE/frameset&FF=c102337pd&1%2C1%2C#.U3Ba8qSQ-Uk

## West Elevation

The west elevation contains the main entry to the building and faces Bay View Terrace. There is a sloping grass verge from the road to the site boundary with the house set down at a lower level than the road.

The dominant feature of the elevation is the roof form. The main roof is a hip roof clad in terracotta plain tiles. There are two hipped dormers located either side of a central gable roof. The projecting central gable extends over the entry and there is a smaller gable over the garage.

The main gable is divided into two distinct sections. The upper section is clad with compressed fibre cement sheeting and imitation half timbering. Two of the battens to the half timbering are curved. The lower section has half timbering with infill patterned brickwork. The patterns are different to each panel on either side of a central window. The smaller gable is clad with compressed fibre cement sheeting and half timbering. The fascias, finials and bargeboards are simple timber elements.

The face brick chimney has a wide brick base with simple diamond brick decoration to the lower section. Above the eaves line the chimney is divided into two slender chimneys. Both have simple brick banding decoration to the top of the chimneys.

The main roof form has exposed timber rafters to the eaves with quad gutters and rectangular downpipes. The ground floor windows have brick headers and angled brick sills.

The front entry porch has a brick, pointed arch and is brick paved. Adjacent to the front door is a narrow window with obscure glass and a pointed brick arch. There is a brick paved drive that leads to the garage. The paving detail is brick on edge.

At both ends of the house there are brick curved walls that act as privacy screens to the north and south yards.

The roof tiles are in fair condition. There are sections where tiles have dislodged, other sections showing deterioration and areas of previous repair are clearly evident.

## South Elevation

The south elevation is dominated by the large expanse of roof. A large hip roof is over the two storey section of the residence and there is a skillion roof covering the single storey section. There is a smaller hip roof centrally located in the main roof. The walls to the smaller hip roof area are compressed fibre cement with half-timber battens and the window is timber double hung.

The single storey section has timber and glass double doors and timber awning windows. Sections of the roof tiles have lichen (moss) growing and there is ivy growing on parts of the walls. There are small sections of damaged and dislodged tiles to the roof.

#### East Elevation

The east elevation has a random, ashlar, rock faced limestone foundation to 1500mm and clinker brick walls above. The main hip roof has two gables, one to the south and the other to the northern end of the building. The north gable is part of a projecting bay.

The walls have terracotta air vents and below the windows to the ground floor are projecting bricks. It is assumed that these three bricks formed a bracket for window boxes.

There is a terracotta tile clad awning to the ground floor windows supported on timber brackets. Sections of the terracotta tiles have been removed to allow light to the windows. Windows are predominantly timber double hung with some casement windows. Some windows have flyscreens.

There are sections of brick repair, replacement and repointing. A large section of brickwork repair is evident above the ground floor windows to the north end.

#### North Elevation

The north elevation faces Hill Terrace and features dominant roof forms to the first and ground floors. The main hip roof has terracotta plain tiles and a brick chimney. The chimney is similar to the west elevation being divided into two slender chimneys above the eaves line. Both chimneys have simple brick banding decoration and are set at an angle to the base and are orientated towards the corner of the site rather than the north elevation.

The first floor gable is half timbered with compressed fibre cement sheets between the battens.

A dominant element is a large gable roof to the ground floor verandah. The gable is half timbered and is supported by 150mm square timber posts and curved timber brackets to each post. Between the posts is a timber handrail supported on 900mm high timber posts. Between the posts are brick infill panels.

The verandah has a timber floor and a compressed fibre cement sheet ceiling with timber cover battens. The ceiling has downlights.

#### Internal - Ground Floor

The house has a rectangular floor plan with the formal rooms located to the northern end of the building and the more informal rooms to the south. The entry porch to the west (Bayview Terrace) is recessed with a step up to the front door. The timber boarded door and adjacent window have a pointed brick arch head.

The ground floor consists of a den, lounge room, entry hall, bathroom, dining room, open-plan kitchen dining area and laundry/WC. The staircase to the upper level is located to the south of the entry and is centrally located. The lounge, den and dining are at the northern end and kitchen-dining and laundry/WC are at the southern end. The bathroom is located under the stairs and accessed by three steps.

The construction and finishes of the northern rooms are largely intact with masonry rendered painted walls, plaster ceilings with timber beams, joists and battens, 110mm timber floor boards, 130mm timber skirtings with half round, timber plank doors with brass hardware, double hung windows and cast iron light fittings.

## Entry Hall

The entrance hall contains the main timber stair and six rooms are accessed from this space. The floor has 110mm wide timber boards with a simple timber profile skirting and quarter round.

The walls are face dark brick to a height of approximately 2 metres. The upper walls have jarrah timber framing with plaster infill panels. Some panels have

angled timber members. The ceiling has jarrah beams and joists with plaster infill panels.

The central ceiling hung light is a decorative iron fitting with dragon motifs as part of the design.

There is a pointed arch leadlight window adjacent to the entry. The front door is a single door constructed of timber plank (265mm wide planks) with decorative iron hinges that extend across the three planks of the door. The door has decorative iron handles.

The stair has three flights and two landings. The timber balustrade has painted timber infill panels and is 760mm high. The square timber newel posts and timber handrail are simple profiles. The treads and risers are timber.

There is pointed arch detailing to the window and door.

#### Den

The den is accessed from the hall and also from the northern verandah. The room features a brick fireplace and jarrah timber joinery throughout.

The timber floor is carpeted and has a simple profile timber skirting and quarter round. The walls are painted masonry with a sand finish and two wall vents.

There is one timber double hung window with a simple architrave and sill and timber French doors with six glass infill panels to the verandah. The French doors and the window have simple timber pelmets.

The two single doors are timber plank (265mm wide planks) with decorative wrought iron hinges that extend across the three planks of the door. The doors have decorative iron handles. The ceiling has jarrah beams and joists with plaster infill panels.

The brick hearth fireplace has a timber mantle shelf with decorative timber supports. Adjacent to the fireplace is a timber fixture for hanging the fireplace tools.

There are three wall mounted iron light fittings.

Adjacent to the fireplace is a built in jarrah cupboard with an open bookcase above.

Framed original coloured plans are hanging on the southern wall.

#### Living

The living room is accessed from the hall and the northern verandah. The room has formal qualities with the dominant features being the face brick fireplace to the north wall, a projecting bay window to the east and jarrah timber joinery throughout.

The fireplace has a brick hearth and timber mantle shelf. On the west side of the fireplace is a timber double hung window and a 12 pane single door to the east.

The projecting bay window to the east has timber casement windows with four panes to each sash. The rendered, painted masonry walls have a chamfer finish to the corners. The ceiling has jarrah beams and joists with plaster infill panels.

There are two built in timber cupboards with an upper open bookcase to either side of the projecting bay window. There are three wall mounted iron light fittings.

## Dining

The dining room is accessed from the hall and the kitchen and is the smallest of the formal rooms. The room has similar finishes and features to the den and living room. The fireplace is centrally located on the north wall and it has simple brick and render detailing and is not as elaborate as the fireplaces to the two other formal rooms. There are two timber double hung windows with simple architraves and sills.

The plank timber doors have decorative iron hardware and there is an elaborately detailed iron central light fitting. There are two modern ceiling mounted light fittings.

WC

The hallway returns around the main stair with access to the garage and also to a WC that is located down three steps under the stair. The hall is face brick with painted render above door height. There is a recessed timber nook adjacent to the WC with timber detailing consistent with the formal rooms. The WC has modern tiling and fixtures.

## Kitchen/Family

The kitchen and family rooms are located at the southern end of the house and combined with an eating area is one informal open space. There is a slight floor level change (step up) from the entry hall to the family area. The ceiling line alters at the southern end of the kitchen and eating area with evidence of a previous wall still extant at this point. The kitchen and eating area has a modern flat plasterboard ceiling with downlights and the adjacent family room has an angled ceiling following the line of the skillion roof. An exposed painted beam extends the full width of the family room.

The masonry walls have a painted smooth render finish. There are timber double doors to the south elevation and timber joinery has a simple profile. Adjacent to the kitchen is a walk in pantry with a timber panelled door. A small vestibule links the kitchen with the dining room.

A doorway to the western wall of the family room leads to a laundry and WC. These rooms have similar finishes to the family room.

#### Internal - First Floor

The first floor consists of five bedrooms, two bathrooms and a study. These are accessed from a central timber staircase from the lower level. Three bedrooms are in the northern end and the other two, the study and the bathrooms are at the southern end.

Generally the construction and finishes are masonry rendered painted walls, plaster ceilings with plaster cornices, 110mm timber floor boards, 130mm timber skirtings with half round beading, timber framed and infilled doors with brass hardware and double hung windows. Additions in some or all rooms are ceiling fans, AC reverse, downlights and built in robes.

All rooms, apart from bath 2, are accessed from the hall. The stairs are centrally located and have a landing area adjacent to the hall. The hall features a timber battened plaster ceiling, built in jarrah cupboards and jarrah joinery, (doors, skirting, architraves and cornice). The timber joinery and timber battens to the ceiling create a strong contrast with the light coloured paint to the walls and ceiling.

There is some sub floor movement adjacent to bedroom one.

#### Bedroom 1

The main bedroom (bed1) is the largest room on the first floor and is located above the living room. The dominant features of the room include a timber double hung window with horizontal proportions and fixed glass side lights, an angled section of the ceiling that follows the roof line to the north wall and a jarrah framed and panelled door with decorative iron hardware.

Modern services to the room include downlights, ceiling fan and an air conditioning register to the ceiling. There is some evidence of damp to the ceiling in north east corner of the room.

## Bedrooms 2 and 3

Bed 2 and bed 3 are located on the western side of the residence and are smaller rooms than bed 1. The rooms have similar detailing to bed 1 with flat ceilings to part of the room and angled ceilings where the ceiling meets the external wall. Both rooms have single timber double hung windows. Bed 2 has a small wardrobe that is integrated into the existing fabric and bed 3 has a more contemporary built in wardrobe.

Bed 2 is in fair condition with some evidence of damp to the ceiling in a number of locations and hairline cracking to the east wall.

#### Bedrooms 4 and 5

Bed 4 and bed 5 are located on the eastern side of the residence and both are accessed from the main hall. The rooms have similar detailing to the other bedrooms. Bed 4 has a small wardrobe that is integrated into the existing fabric and bed 5 has a more contemporary built in wardrobe. Both have flat and angled ceilings, following the line of the roof. Bed 5 has windows to the full length of the east external wall and the ceiling slopes to both the east and south external walls. The sloping ceiling creates an attic style within the space.

#### Study

The study is on the southern side of the first floor and the finishes and detailing are similar to the bedrooms. The timber double hung window is centrally located in the south wall. The flat plaster ceiling has a narrow section of angled ceiling that follows the line of the hip roof. There is evidence of damp and minor deflection to the ceiling. There is also some cracking to the eastern wall.

#### **Bathrooms**

Two bathrooms are located on the west side of the first floor. Bath 1 is accessed from the hall and bath 2 from the study. Bath 1 is a generous sized room with a bath, separate shower, WC and vanity basin. There is a single timber double hung window with a timber pelmet. The ceiling and cornices are plaster and the floor and walls are tiled. The wall tiling extends to door height. The north wall features a recessed arch with a built in vanity. The recess has a central mirror to the wall with narrow timber side cupboards and a pelmet with a concealed light. Fittings and fixtures are contemporary.

Bath 2 is a smaller room with a shower, WC and vanity basin. The floor and walls are tiled. The walls are tiled to approximately 2 metres. Fittings and fixtures are contemporary

## 13. 3 COMPARATIVE INFORMATION

Inter-War Old English buildings

A search of the State Heritage Office database for Inter-War Old English buildings returns 47 places, of which 15 are listed on the State Register of Heritage Places (RHP). Despite the fact that Inter-War Old English is primarily a residential style, this group of 15 includes hotels, commercial buildings, administration buildings, hospital buildings and a chapel. The most comparable places to *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park*:

- P1051 The Hermitage (RHP): designed by prominent Western Australian architect and Catholic Priest John Cyril Hawes, this place is a masonry wall building in the Inter-War Old English style considered to exhibit a high degree of artistic and technical refinement.
- P1762 Fairbridge Village (RHP): this place is a village-like collection of buildings constructed between 1921 and 1938, with a number in in the Inter-War Old English style. The place has significant historical connections with the British child migration scheme of the early twentieth century.
- P3266 St Joseph's Church and Presbytery (RHP): the Presbytery of this
  place is described in the assessment documentation as 'a hybrid style that
  could be described as Inter-War Old English.'
- P3677 Kulahea (RHP): this place is the only known surviving private residence designed by George Temple Poole, constructed in 1922 in the Inter-War Old English style. The place has remained largely unaltered and was home to state politician Hon. Charles Frederic North.
- P3227 The Maisonettes (RHP): this place is a two storey block of flats constructed in 1934 in an 'idiosyncratic style derivative of the Arts and Craft movement and Art Deco style,' the result being considered to be similar to the Inter-War Old English style.
- P5507 Mine Manager's House, Wiluna (RHP): this place is a single storey residence constructed in 1929 for the Manager of the Wiluna Gold Mines Ltd. The place is a rare extant example of a mine manager's residence described as a mix of Inter-War bungalow and Federation Bungalow, with elements of the interior employing elements of Inter-War Old English style.
- P8894 Model Brick Home (RHP): designed by Summerhayes, this place is a single-storey brick and tile residence built as a model home in 1934. The place is described as a simplified version of the Inter-War Old English style, and was one of two winning designs in the competition run by the Model Homes Committee as part of the Building Revival Campaign of the 1930s.

There are three further places in the Assessment Program which are comparable to *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park* as examples of Inter-War Old English style:

- P3223 Moyola; constructed in 1930, the place is a two storey stone and studframed structure featuring a picturesque tiled roof-scape with steep battened gables, dormer windows and tall projecting chimneys.
- P17291 House, 1 Wilson Street, Claremont: a brick and tile one and half storey dwelling with a prominent irregularly stepped random faced limestone chimney. The front gable is steeply pitched and extends down to just below door height. It is swept out at one corner to form a porch with an arched opening. The steeply pitched main roof contains a small dormer casement

- window, and sweeps down over the front casement windows. The property is fronted by a rock-faced random limestone wall.
- P9193 House, 18 Karoo Street, South Perth: Brick and tile residence self-designed by Eustance Gresley Cohen in 1923, this place features the bay windows, flying gable with half-timbered effect, catslide roof and timber detailing of the Inter-War Old English Style. The property is located towards the back of the block, set amongst a surrounding garden.

One mixed-use place is somewhat comparable to *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park* in demonstrating a similar roofing material and style:

• P1998 London Court (RHP): a three and four level open air arcade simulating an Elizabethan period shopping street, the richly detailed facade of the place and distinctive clocks are important tourist attractions. Minor changes have been made over the years, but the interior of London Court has changed little. The interior apartments of the court feature large Tudor style fireplaces with electric fires in situ. The rooftop still features the original laundries and hanging lines for the drying of clothes. The stairs are terrazzo finished to the first floor level on the west and to the second floor on the east. In the tower blocks at each end the terrazzo finish extends to all the floors. There is a lift at the northern (Hay Street) tower which has original timber panelling with Tudor embellishments, a coved timber ceiling and a clock hand elevator indicator at each floor.

## Reginald and Edwin Summerhayes

A search of the State Heritage Office database for places associated with Reginald and Edwin Summerhayes returns a total of 42 places, of which 18 are listed on the RHP. Of these associated places, the most directly comparable to *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park* as places designed for or used as single residences include:

- P3682 Pine Lodge (RHP): a Federation Queen Anne brick residence featuring a prominent belvedere and quality craftmanship. The place is representative of the development of Cottesloe and is a finely executed example of the architectural style.
- P10881 Curdnatta (RHP): a Federation Queen Anne residence designed for A Hunter, manager of the Northam flour mill. The place is representative of the architect-designed dwellings for people in managerial positions in the 1910s.
- P1355 Kobeelya, Katanning: an asymmetrical two storey residence in the Federation Queen Anne style, noted as a local landmark. The place was designed for F Piesse, and influential state politician and a leading figure of Katanning.
- P13700 Renkema Building: A two storey Inter-War Old English style building originally designed as a residence (now used as a commercial store). The place was designed specifically to make use of its prominent corner aspect.
- P15832 House, 1 Cooper Street, Nedlands: A single storey brick house in the Inter-War California Bungalow style, originally designed as a residence and now used by the Music Examinations Board.

Another place that should be noted is P11669 Residence, 5 Bay View Terrace Mosman Park, also known as Mackellar-Hall House. The house is a two storey Inter-War Romanesque residence, two blocks south of *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park*. The place was initially designed by Rodney Alsop in 1926, but the designs were finished by Edwin and Reginald Summerhayes in 1934.<sup>42</sup>

#### Inter-War Residences

A search of the State Heritage Office database for residences built in the western suburbs during the inter-war period (1915-1940), returns a total of 337 places, of which 11 are listed on the State Register of Heritage Places. Determining those most comparable to *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park* as architect-designed homes for wealthy clients is difficult to determine, given the constraints of the State Heritage Office database. Some examples listed on the RHP that are comparable to *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park* include:

- P3677 Kulahea (RHP): discussed above.
- P3227 The Maisonettes (RHP): discussed above.
- P7468 Trafalgar House (RHP): a single storey brick residence constructed in 1914/1915 in a Federation Queen Anne style for the manager of the Hoskins and Kalgoorlie foundries. The place is a good example of the substantial residences built in Cottesloe following the Gold Boom.
- P7935 John Curtin's House (RHP): constructed in 1923, this place consists of an Inter-War California Bungalow style residence, built on a previously vacant block for politician and later Prime Minister John Curtin.

#### Conclusions

The comparative evidence indicates that *House, 2 Hill Terrace, Mosman Park* is rare as an example of an Inter-War Old English style residence, and is of moderate rarity as a place designed by Edwin and Reginald Summerhayes. As an example of an architect-designed residence demonstrating the development of Perth's western suburbs during the inter-war period, there are a large number of places on the Sate Heritage Office database but relatively few recognised as such on the RHP.

## 13. 4 KEY REFERENCES

----

13. 5 FURTHER RESEARCH

----

Hocking Heritage Studio, Municipal Inventory Review – Draft (Town of Mosman Park:2013), p.127-128.