11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE
The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council (WA) in September 1991 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

11.1. AESTHETIC VALUE
Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse has a high degree of artistic and technical sophistication, both internally and externally, and exhibit a well resolved combination of architectural, symbolic and artistic motifs. (Criterion 1.1)

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse is an outstanding example of Hawes’ eclectic architectural style. (Criterion 1.2)

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse has a landmark quality in Mullewa because of their unusual construction and prominent location at the corner of Doney and Bowes Streets. (Criterion 1.3)

In association with the Presentation Sisters Convent and School (1915), Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse form a precinct of early twentieth century Catholic buildings in Mullewa. (Criterion 1.4)

11.2. HISTORIC VALUE
Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul has a close association with the expansion of the activities of the Roman Catholic Diocese of Geraldton in the 1920s. (Criterion 2.1)

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse has a close association with Monsignor John Hawes, both as architect and as parish priest at the time of their construction. Hawes’ life and works are prominent within the history of the Mid-West Region of Western Australia. (Criteria 2.2, 2.3)

11.3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE
The Church demonstrates technical sophistication in the construction of the domes over the sanctuary and baptistery. They were constructed with an innovative revolving template designed to enable successive courses of brickwork to be laid. (Criterion 3.3)
11. 4. SOCIAL VALUE

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse is highly valued by the community of Mullewa and surrounding districts as a place in which to celebrate religious observance and as an unusual and eclectic piece of architecture. (Criterion 4.1)

The inclusion of the Priesthouse, Hawes' personal residence during his time at Mullewa, gives additional interest to the place. (Criterion 4.1)

Today, the Church and, in particular, the Priesthouse, as a museum of Hawes' work, is highly valued as a tourist destination as well as a working church and contributes to the Mullewa community's sense of place. (Criterion 4.2)

12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

12. 1. RARITY

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse is a rare example of the combination of Hawes' eclectic design principles with his personal involvement, at every level, in the construction and subsequent use, as a priest, of the buildings. (Criterion 5.1)

12. 2. REPRESENTATIVENESS

The design of the Church is representative of Monsignor J.C. Hawes' distinctive style of church design. The Priesthouse is attached to the Church by means of a cloister giving it both a physical and an historical connection. While not architecturally as complex as the Church, the Priesthouse has, nevertheless, an important role as a representative piece of domestic architecture by Hawes. (Criterion 6.1)

12. 3. CONDITION

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse is in sound condition. Work has been done on both the Church and the Priesthouse to alleviate problems of rising damp, insufficient drainage, and the entry of dust into the buildings. Maintenance of both buildings has been undertaken on a regular basis and the place is in good condition.

12. 4. INTEGRITY

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse has a high degree of integrity. The Church continues to be used for the original purpose for which it was designed. The use of the Priesthouse as a museum and the furnishing and presentation of the rooms to be representative of the era in which the house was built, and lived in by Hawes, is compatible with the original intention of the place as a residence.

12. 5. AUTHENTICITY

Register of Heritage Places - Assessment Doc'n  Our Lady of Mt Carmel 2
10/10/1995
The *Church* is intact, and retains a high degree of authenticity. The additions (to the north transept) are harmonious. The changes to the interior that have occurred due to liturgical changes are necessary and show evolution of use. The cement rendering of the walls internally, and at their bases externally, could be removed if required.

The *Priesthouse* has a reasonable degree of authenticity. Conversion of the place, to a museum, in 1980, necessitated some replacement of original fabric. Nevertheless, the work was done with some sensitivity to the cultural heritage significance of the place and, therefore, the authenticity of the place is not diminished.
13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

13.1. DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

In the early years of the twentieth century, the Roman Catholic Diocese of Geraldton experienced rapid growth due to the development of surrounding land for wheat and sheep farming properties particularly, from returned service personnel and migrants who started new farms with their families. In addition to the growth of Geraldton, itself, smaller regional centres in the diocese experienced growth including Mullewa, Northampton, Morawa, and Perenjori; and the towns on the Perth-Geraldton road such as Mingenew, Three Springs, Carnamah and Coorow. These towns all had populations with active Roman Catholic congregations.¹

*Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priesthouse* was designed by John Cyril Hawes. Hawes (1876-1956) was attached to the Geraldton Diocese between the years 1915-1939. Within that period he was architect, and in many cases the builder, of a number of Roman Catholic churches in the area.

John Cyril Hawes was the first resident Parish Priest at Mullewa, from late 1920 to December 1938. As a young man, Hawes trained as an architect. Although he met with a measure of success in his profession, Hawes continued to feel drawn to a more religious life. In 1904, he joined the Anglican Church. Following a period in the Bahamas he came to the conclusion that to be a proper priest he needed to belong to the Catholic Church.² In March 1911, he was received into the Catholic Church. As Father John Hawes, he arrived in Western Australia in November 1915, and was attached to the Geraldton Diocese between the years 1915-1939.

Hawes had an excellent relationship with his original Bishop, Bishop William Bernard Kelly. Kelly had been instrumental in bringing Hawes to W.A. from Rome, where Hawes had previously been studying. Hawes continued his activities as an architect, his skills particularly in demand in the Western Australian countryside where the vast open spaces and a small but growing population provided numerous opportunities to design new church buildings. Prior to the construction of the *Church* and the *Priesthouse* in Mullewa, Hawes had in Western Australia designed: *Francis Xavier Cathedral* in Geraldton (1915), *Melangata* (1916, a station homestead near Yalgoo), The *Sacred Heart Convent* in Northampton (1919, for the Presentation Sisters), the *Chapel of St Hyacinth* at Yalgoo (1920, for the Dominican Sisters), and a new *Cathedral* for Perth (1922, which was not built).³

---


³ Anson; Bourke; Evans; *Monsignor Hawes Heritage Trail*.
Hawes' philosophy towards the design of church buildings was that:

A proper church is no mere assembly-hall, theatre or auditorium for preaching and community singing; but it is first of all a place of sacrifice ... It should breathe forth an atmosphere of prayer, of religious awe and supernatural mystery."  

He advocated that a church, regardless of size, should be of monumental character and that the design should be reminiscent of the past and also inclusive of the present.

At the time of Hawes' arrival in Mullewa an iron clad hall was being used for services. This hall had previously been used as a school at another site in Mullewa and had been moved and rebuilt on the current church site, in 1919, adjacent to a timber framed and iron roofed presbytery. To the west of this makeshift church was a stone convent building, Presentation Sisters Convent and School which had been built in 1915.

Hawes' initial sketch of the Church (dated 1920) was possibly drawn while in England, prior to returning from first holiday from the Geraldton Diocese. The first photograph of work (in a sequential booklet at the Geraldton archives of the Roman Catholic Church) on the Church is dated October 1921. The first stone was laid in the north east corner on the 24 May 1921 and trenches for the footings were dug around the sanctuary at the end of the old iron church. In October 1921, work was suspended to allow Hawes time to devote his energies to the design of Perth Cathedral.

Bishop Kelly died in December 1921. The next Bishop of Geraldton, Bishop Richard Ryan, arrived in Geraldton in October 1923. Although Ryan did not favour Hawes' artistic endeavours, Hawes was relatively free to pursue his own ideas for his Parish Church.

Work resumed, in October 1923, and, by June 1924, the walls to the north-east corner were 2400-3000 mm high. The blessing and laying of the foundation stone of the Church took place on 14 September 1924 with both Archbishop Clune and Bishop Ryan present. By November 1924, the eastern gable and south transept were largely finished. The construction of the dome over the sanctuary was begun in March 1925, using a revolving timber template designed by Hawes, which reduced the timber

---

5 *ibid.*
7 The foundation stone for the convent was laid prior to Hawes arrival in Australia. It is thought that the convent was influenced in its design by the Reverend Mother of the Presentation Sisters - Sister Brigid - but there is no substantial evidence to support this. (From a conversation with Ruth Marchant James; who has recently completed an history of the Presentational Sisters. (17 July 1994).)
8 The archives of the Geraldton Diocese of the Roman Catholic Church at Bishop's House in Maitland Street, Geraldton.
9 John Taylor, citing Anson and Evans.
10 *The Record* 20 September 1924.
11 The archives of the Geraldton Diocese of the Roman Catholic Church at Bishop's House in Maitland Street, Geraldton.
support structure needed. By June 1925, the dome and 'lantern' were finished. The bell tower was constructed in August 1925. In November and December 1925, construction of the northern transept was underway. The Church was opened for services on 13 December 1925 although the nave was not completed. Hawes wrote in the first souvenir brochure:

That where it cannot all be completed at once, God's part should be built first: the altar and the house of the altar (ara, et domus ara). Let the people continue in their temporary tin part - or look in at the windows. The first thing is to make a permanent resting place for the tabernacle - a real home for Jesus and Mary. Hawes worked largely on his own as mason, (but with some paid labourer's assistance and help from parishioners carting stone etcetera), and it took over two and a half years to complete the difficult forms that make up the sanctuary and transepts. And there is no doubt that this was an intensely personal work for Hawes, and that he gave all his physical and mental strength to the creation of this church. But perhaps the 'legendary' tales (that have become part of folklore in the area) exaggerate the amount of physical work Hawes actually completed. He had the assistance of many enthusiastic parishioners in a strongly Catholic town. And as work progressed and time went on, finance became easier - as debt was cleared from the Convent and School - and the enthusiasm of his fellow clergy and parishioners grew.

In 1926, a professional mason was employed and the major north, east, and south walls and intervening arches that form the nave, the north porch and the baptistery were all completed in little over a year. The completed Church was opened by Archbishop Clune in May 1927.

The resultant building was a diverse mixture of styles and influences, resolved into a pleasingly solid, locally relevant building. Tony Evans described Hawes' success in this regard:

It became his personal testament unrestrained by criticism or interference, an embodiment of his romantic and spiritual temperament, a building which above all his others, invites our respect for him as an artist craftsman.

Having completed the Church in 1927, Hawes was in an excellent position to proceed with a new presbytery. His own personal ability as an architect and builder was now beyond question. The resulting Priesthouse was a simpler but no less idiosyncratic domestic design which includes an inglenook, stained glass windows, and face stone and brickwork. It was completed in 1929.

---

12 The Record December 26th, 1925: The opening of the new church on 13 December 13 1925 (not completed - the nave is the corrugated iron clad 'old' church).
13 Souvenir of the Church of Our Lady of Mt. Carmel and S. S. Peter and Paul, Mullewa,, Western Australia (brochure compiled by Hawes, no pagination)
14 John Hawes' work book, held at the Priesthouse Museum, notes on 30.3.1926, David Blackwell, mason, was employed to erect the north, south and west walls at a cost of £180. David Blackwell was also involved in the construction of the Masonic Lodge (1924) and Anglican Rectory (1927) at Mullewa. Also, information supplied by Mr Albert Keefe in May 1994, (formerly of Mullewa and the Parish Council of The Church), 54 Halgania Way Duncraig Phone 448 3081.
15 The Record 7 May 1927: The opening of the Church by Archbishop Clune.
16 Evans, p. 110.
The completion of Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priests... effectively formed a Catholic 'precinct' in Mullewa, consisting of the two new buildings and the Presentation Sisters Convent and School.

13.  PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul and the Priests... is sited on the intersection of Bowes and Doney Streets, Mullewa. The Church addresses Doney Street and the Priests... is sited behind it to the south-east. Although the Priests... was built after the completion of the Church, it is connected to the main building by an arcade and shows, in a more subdued fashion, many of the stylistic attributes of the Church.

The exterior of the Church has a long, low form reminiscent of the Spanish Mission Churches of Southern California and the interior of the church has Romanesque overtones.\(^{17}\) The building is built of local Mullewa stone with concrete blocks for the quoins and mouldings, and features a red tiled roof. Peter Anson describes the Church in various phrases including:

(IT)...was the expression of the baroque and rococo architecture of Central America which Father Hawes was immersed in at the time. On this small village church he really let himself go, indulging his whimsical fancies. He described it as 'of Romanesque type, somewhat after that of the churches of southern France when Romanesque was in a state of transition to the Gothic. The exterior... reminiscent of the Spanish Franciscan mission churches of California.'\(^ {18}\)

The domes have been described as Byzantine,\(^ {19}\) while 'The north porch was a various mingling of Celtic and Spanish details'.\(^ {20}\) The eclectic mixture of styles was typical of Hawes' work. Hawes quoted William Lethaby as saying: 'The Architecture should be reminiscent without pedantry, and varied without being freakish.'\(^ {21}\)

The west front is crowned by a corbelled pediment and has a deeply recessed arch within which is a large corbelled window; above the doorway is a Latin inscription in roman lettering which, translated, reads: 'To God Most Good, Most Great: and in honour of the Blessed Virgin Mary of Mount Carmel, and the Holy Apostles Peter and Paul, this Holy Temple is dedicated'. Extra width is given to the facade by the porch extending on the north and baptistery on the south.\(^ {22}\) In the angle of the nave and transept rises the campanile, terminating in a lantern buttressed with pinnacles at its base.\(^ {23}\) There is an absence of smooth mechanically finished surfaces which gives the Church a rough and rustic feel.

Entry to the Church is via the north porch. The plan of the Church is cruciform with the high altar under the dome at the intersection of the

---

17 Souvenir of the Church ...
20 Anson, pp. 168-169.
21 Souvenir of the Church ...
22 ibid.
23 ibid.
nave and transepts. The nave has five bays spanned by transverse pointed arches that support the roof timbering. A timber choir gallery spans the western-most bay. Internally furnishings of the Church have variously been described by Anson as 'baroque', 'classic', 'Gothic' and 'Romanesque', all of which express Hawes' eclectic taste in matters of art and architecture.

Hawes' intense personal commitment and his desire to create a building that reflected the antiquity of Roman Catholicism was handsomely rewarded with this building. The structure of the various parts of the Church was designed to reflect the spiritual meanings of each of the various elements of the corporate Church. Details near the entry porch, the choir gallery, and nave are both decorative and explanatory of the liturgy. The decorative elements increase as ones approaches the sanctuary and high altar.

After the Second Vatican Council, the liturgy of the Roman Catholic Church changed which resulted in modifications to the Church. The altar was remodelled to face the congregation and the paschal candle stand was converted into a base for a lectern. After removal of the pulpit, a new confessional was built in the south east end of the nave to replace the original confessional, adjacent to the north porch, which was suffering from damp.

In 1962, an extension to the north transept was completed in a reasonably harmonious fashion. Unfortunately, it diminishes the soaring vertical effect of the bell tower but it was probably the most expedient way of catering for the increasing numbers of parishioners. Anticipating an increase in the numbers of parishioners, Hawes had drawn up a scheme for expanding the building as early as 1936, although this was not followed.

Other changes have been made to the interior. Problems with rising damp led to sand and mortar being a constant cleaning problem as it fell from between stones. To combat this the interior stone and brickwork was rendered over. In recent times, an extensive drainage system has been installed around the building to alleviate continuing problems. Similarly, the roof was previously unlined, but the underside of the tiles - while fitting in with the rough appeal of the Church - allowed too much dust and too many insects into the interior, and it was subsequently lined with timber boards at the same time as the interior stone and brickwork was rendered over.

In 1988/89, a $15,000 NEGP grant enabled conservation of the Church to be undertaken. The work included restoration of the west wall and the arch, extension of downpipes to facilitate drainage, replacement of bituminised felt shingles to the roof where required, restoration of the east wall and the replacement of some fretted stones. Restoration of the confessional design

---

24 ibid.
26 Drawing showing possible enlargement of the Church dated 1936 (Geraldton Diocesan archives).
and details to the original, and the removal of the interior moulded concrete screens in the vestry and the restoration of the interior masonry in the baptistery were undertaken.28

The Priests house was built after the Church was completed as a residence for Hawes. A wide cloister featuring eight arches with a gable over the main entrance connects it to the Church. The cloister follows the same dynamism and detailing of the Church, thus linking the two structures together. The columns supporting the cloister were originally un-rendered concrete, but have since been rendered over.

In 1980, a new presbytery was built for the parish priest and conservation of the Priests house was begun. Rising damp was treated and a termite treatment undertaken. There was replacement of some floors, render and window treatments and the repair or reinstatement of other elements which had been neglected.29

A programme of regular maintenance has been undertaken on both buildings.

13.3. REFERENCES

John Taylor, Architect: 'The Church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the Holy Apostles St. Peter and St. Paul; and 'the Priest House" Lots 11, 12, 13 Doney Street, Mullewa' (for Heritage Council of W.A., May 1994)

National Trust Assessment Exposition.

Australian Heritage Commission Data Sheet.