

REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES -ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in November 1996 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

PRINCIPAL AUSTRALIAN HISTORIC THEME(S)

- 2.4.4 Migrating through organised colonisation
- 3.6 Recruiting labour
- 5.1 Working in harsh conditions
- 5.7 Surviving as Indigenous people in a white-dominated society
- 6. Educating
- 8. Developing Australia's cultural life
- 9.3.2 Bringing up children
- 9.2 Growing up

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA THEME(S)

- 1. Demographic settlement and mobility
- 3. Occupations
- 4. Social and civic activities
- 6. People

11.1 AESTHETIC VALUE*

The main building is a good example of the Victorian Romanesque style constructed in local limestone with soft red brick detailing. Its arcaded verandahs and grand proportions also add to its aesthetic appeal. (Criterion 1.1)

The chapel is a good example of Inter-War Romanesque style. Its painted rendered brickwork, elegant proportions and fine interior detailing are valued by the community. (Criterion 1.1)

The former presbytery, mature trees, lawns and rose gardens add to the picturesque quality of the grounds. (Criterion 1.1)

The walled entry statements, the main building, and the towers on the former technical trades building, classroom block, kitchen/dining building, and to a lesser extent those towers at the rear of the main building form distinctive landmarks. (Criterion 1.3)

^{*} For consistency, all references to architectural style are taken from Apperly, Richard; Irving, Robert and Reynolds, Peter *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*, Angus & Robertson, North Ryde, 1989.

The adjacent low-lying wetlands and river-flats to the east and south of the building group contribute to its landmark character. (Criterion 1.3)

Clontarf is significant in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics valued by the community including its formal entry statement, driveway, mature trees, rose gardens, expansive lawns, wetlands, the main building, the chapel, former presbytery and the former technical trades building. These areas collectively form a significant cultural environment. (Criterion 1.4)

11. 2. HISTORIC VALUE

Clontarf is one of the significant projects of the Christian Brothers in Western Australian and in other Australian states from the late 1860s. The place demonstrates the organisation's philanthropic educational basis. (Criterion 2.1)

The wetland areas and spring at the east of the site are tangible reminders of Aboriginal occupation and use of the land prior to European settlement. (Criterion 2.1)

Clontarf is historically important as a place of schooling for day boys and boarders, residential care, education and supervision of orphans, vagrants, children from suffering families, child migrants and Aboriginal children from 1901 to the 1980s. (Criterion 2.2)

Occupation of the place by the RAAF during World War II is historically important. (Criterion 2.2)

Clontarf represents memories and associations for those in whose lives it played an important role and is a tangible reminder of the experiences of boys who suffered abuse and exploitation at the hands of those charged with their care. (Criterion 2.2)

Clontarf is important for its close association with individuals such as Brother Keaney, Michael Cavanagh and Marie Jackson. Brother Keaney was responsible for *Clontarf* during its major period of development from 1935-41 and went on to instigate a further major building program at Bindoon. Michael Cavanagh designed the main building and Marie Jackson designed the chapel. (Criterion 2.3)

The buildings at *Clontarf* constructed 1935-41 are important as examples of the technical achievement of the Brothers and students under their supervision. The chapel is especially important as an example of the level of excellence finally achieved through this phase of construction activity. (Criterion 2.4)

11. 3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

Clontarf and the associated wetland to the east have the potential to yield information, through archaeological survey and investigation, that could add to our understanding of human occupation of the locality. (Criterion 3.2)

11. 4. SOCIAL VALUE

Clontarf is highly valued by the Christian Brothers as a place of great achievement, and as an example of the organisation's philanthropic educational basis. (Criterion 4.1)

The place is highly valued by the Aboriginal community as a place of education and self-determination integral to the formation of their modern culture. (Criterion 4.1)

The place is highly valued by the community of the surrounding district as evidenced by its listing in the Municipal Inventory. (Criterion 4.1)

The landmark qualities of the place and the longevity of its existence contribute to the community's sense of place. (Criterion 4.2)

12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

12.1. RARITY

Clontarf presents a tangible reminder of the institutional care of orphan and vagrant children, child migrants and children with behavioural and emotional difficulties from 1901 to the 1970s, a style of care that is no longer practised. (Criterion 5.2)

12. 2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

Clontarf is representative of the type of institution established for the care and education of orphan, vagrant, migrant, boarded or Aboriginal children in the first half of the twentieth century. (Criterion 6.1)

The place is representative of a number of similar facilities for orphans, vagrants, child migrants and Aboriginal children established and maintained by Christian Brothers in Western Australia and Australia. (Criterion 6.2)

12.3 CONDITION

Generally *Clontarf* is in a poor condition, however particularly important elements such as the Chapel, main entry structures and lawned/treed areas are in good condition.

Little effective maintenance has ever been carried out on the site and those minor works that have taken place in recent years are in-effect "too little-too late". Buildings constructed from 1935-41 are the poorest on the site. New construction on the site has resulted in the need to upgrade all services to the site. All pre-existing services are in a poor condition.

The handball courts, and walled entry statements adjacent to the church and on the sports ground are in very poor condition.

The construction of the towers at the rear of the main building, the concrete verandahs around its internal courtyard and garden beds at the front verandah detract from the aesthetic qualities of the place.

12.4 INTEGRITY

The original intention, being the central driveway and dominance of the main building, is generally intact. The orderly layout of remaining buildings is less so, with inadequate inter-building spaces (courtyard space/viewing space) being provided such as that between the recreation hall and the main building. The location of new buildings restricted by external requirements (noise, owner's requirements) more than to the benefit of the site arrangement and use as a whole.

The current educational uses are generally compatible with existing building types and the identified values of the place.

The values identified are not likely to be sustainable unless substantial resources are made available for the conservation of the place, especially considering the limited resources of its current tenants and future owners.

The place does have the ability to be restored however in view of the enormity of the work required, there may not be the will or resources to conserve the place as it exists today. Management practices and polices would need to be developed, adopted and funded for any restoration to successfully occur. Not all elements should necessarily be restored.

Restoration works could continue over an extended period of time however some works are necessary in the immediate future.

The place has a moderate degree of integrity.

12.5 AUTHENTICITY

When viewed as a whole, *Clontarf* is not in its original state. The farmlands, bakehouse, dairy etc., which were once imperative to existence of the orphanage, have gone. *Clontarf* today, is the remnants of two periods of development of the orphanage, a short occupation of the site by the RAAF and a long period of changing directions and functions. It is that which should guide the conservation of the place.

The chapel and new building such as the brother's residence and Abmusic new building are substantially in their original state and have a high degree of authenticity.

To a lesser extent, the main building, the former presbytery, the gymnasium, the classroom block, the lower handball courts and pool, the former kitchen dining room and the matron's residence have intact original fabric. These have a moderate degree of authenticity.

The technical trades building (portion) and the workshops are substantially reconstructed. The workshops have a low degree of authenticity whilst the former is moderate due to the type of work carried out.

13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

The documentary evidence has been compiled by Helen Burgess, Historian and Research Consultant. The physical evidence has been compiled by Alice Steedman, Architect.

The historical information for this assessment has been based on the conservation plan: *Clontarf: Conservation Management Plan [Draft]*, prepared by Allom Lovell Hocking Conservation Consultants, for the Provincialate of Christian Brothers, October 1998.

13.1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

Clontarf is located at 295 Manning Road, Waterford in the City of South Perth. It is located on Part Locations 57, 58, 65 and 87. The original 1901 building is a two-storey Victorian Romanesque style building built for the Christian Brothers as an orphanage. It was designed by the architect, Michael Francis Cavanagh, and the contractor was Mr J. Coghill.

In 1802, the Christian Brothers' organisation (the Brothers) was founded by Edmund Rice in Waterford, Ireland, to educate poor boys, this later developed to the institutional care of orphans. In 1868, the Brothers first arrived in eastern Australia, and then, in 1894, they came to Western Australia. On 23 November 1897, the Brothers assumed management of St Joseph's boys' orphanage in Subiaco, which had been established in 1872 by the Sisters of Mercy.¹

In 1897, Canning Location 87 and Canning Locations 57 and 65 were purchased for a new orphanage. The land was on the north bank of the Canning River and was uncleared bushland with a fresh water spring.² Matthew Gibney, the Roman Catholic Bishop of Perth, was on the Certificates of Title. In 1900, Brother Treacy, the leader of the Brothers in Australia, purchased the site from Bishop Gibney and directed that a new title be created with the names of the four Brothers from the order; Treacy, Mullan, Barron and Bodkin.³ By error the new title also contained Bishop Gibney's name. The site was named *Clontarf* by Brother Treacy after a town in Ireland, and it was to be a place where boys could be accommodated and cared for, given primary education, religious teaching and receive basic training in manual skills and farm practices.⁴

By 1900, plans were under way for the construction of the main building at *Clontarf.* The architect, M. F. Cavanagh, was commissioned to design the buildings - based on preliminary drawings by Brother Bodkin - and the building contract was awarded to Mr J. Coghill for the cost of £8500.⁵ Cavanagh, originally from Victoria, had been practicing in Western Australia since 1895 and had designed several other Catholic institutions.⁶ Limestone and other materials used in the construction were shipped up the Canning River, but were off-loaded on the south side of the river due to the location of a small channel. A jetty was therefore extended most of the way across the river and a small rail-line was installed to move the stone on trolleys pulled by mules.⁷

On 3 January 1901 the foundation stone of the main building was laid by the Most Reverend Matthew Gibney D. D., Lord Bishop of Perth.⁸ Although the site was named *Clontarf*, the actual orphanage was named St Joseph's Boys' Orphanage after the orphanage in Subiaco. On 8 September 1901, the main building, which included a chapel, had been completed and was ready for occupation. The boys from St Joseph's, Subiaco, were relocated to *Clontarf*,

¹ Coldrey, Barry M., *The Scheme: The Christian Brothers and Childcare in Western Australia*, pp. 9-23, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking (Conservation Consultants), 'Clontarf Conservation Management Plan' (Draft Report), prepared for Provincialate of Christian Brothers, October 1998.

² Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³ Certificate of Title, Vol. 10 Fol. 36, 7/7/1897 & 23/5/1900; Certificate of Title, Vol. 111 Fol. 67, 7/7/1897 & 23/5/1900; Certificate of Title Vol. 193 Fol. 132, 23/5/1900. In 1954, the title was no longer under the name of individual Brothers but transferred to the Trustees of the Christian Brothers of Strathfield (NSW), Certificate of Title, Vol. 1172 Fol. 502, 7/7/1954; Although cancelled titles have not been searched it is presumed that loc 58 was also purchased around the same time.

⁴ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 24-26, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, op. cit.

⁵ Main building foundation stone; Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 25-26, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, op. cit. Information from the Christian brother states that Coghill did not perform his duties satisfactorily and he was dismissed and the work was completed by day labour

⁶ Kelly, Ian Phillip, 'Architectural Biography, 1890-1915: a brief biographical list of architects who practiced in Western Australia in the years 1890-1915', thesis prepared for the degree of Master of Architecture, University of Western Australia, 1991.

⁷ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 25-26 as cited in Allom, Lovell Hocking, op. cit.

Foundation Stone of main building, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.
Register of Heritage Places - Assessment Doc'n
Clontarf 14/12/2001

walking to their new orphanage along sand tracks through the bush from Albany Road and carrying the necessary furniture.⁹

A 1902 photograph shows the two-storey tiled roof building a in the Victorian Romanesque style.¹⁰ The facade is symmetrical with a prominent gable at each end with an arcaded verandah at first and second floor level in between. The rear of the building is also shown with a simple timber framed two-storey verandah around a central courtyard. Walls are rusticated limestone with brick quoining and voussoirs around the windows and doors. Other early photographs show the chapel - located in the front half of the first floor in the eastern wing - with a chamfered timber boarded ceiling, vestibule to the north end, pivot hung windows, multi-paned fanlights, and reeded dado. The dormitory rooms had reeded dados and flat ceilings.¹¹

At the time of its establishment, the boys who resided at *Clontarf* were predominantly aged between six and fourteen. The boys were either orphans, or abandoned or had one parent (usually the mother) who was unable to support them. Most were sent by the Inspector of Charities for being neglected or for being involved in criminal activities. In its first few years, there were between 100 to 150 boys based at *Clontarf* under the care of five or six Brothers. After the age of fourteen, most boys left to either find work and/or return to their family. Those who did stay on - because of lack of any other opportunity - assisted the Brothers in the day-to-day running of the institution, but no longer attended school. An apprenticeship program was later developed for these boys.¹²

In 1903, sports grounds for cricket and football were established between the main buildings and the river, as well as a jetty and boat shed. Additional recreation space was later provided by reclaimed swampland.¹³

In 1908, the Brothers purchased a further 28 acres of land to the east of the *Clontarf* site, comprising Lots 80, 81, 82 and 83.¹⁴

In 1914, a statue of St Joseph was placed in the grounds in front of the main building. In 1918, a bandstand was constructed as a performance venue for *Clontarf's* newly formed brass band. In 1919, a manual arts block for carpentry and boot-making was erected to the south-east of the main building.¹⁵

In 1921, Lots 16 and 17 to the west were purchased.¹⁶

By the early 1920s, *Clontarf* was a fully operational farm with orchards and vegetable gardens at the north-eastern end of the site, cultivated and tended

¹⁶ *Clontarf Property List*, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁹ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 25-26; Boulter, Douglas John, oral history recorded by Janice Gothard, 15/7/1988, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

¹⁰ Figure 2.2, as included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid. & Apperly, Irving and Reynolds, *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*, Angus and Robertson, 1989.

¹¹ Figures 2.2, 2.3, 2.7 & 2.8 as included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

¹² Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 28-29, 461-462; Ryan, Brother Kevin, *Brief Overview: History of Clontarf*; Visitation Report, 1932, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

¹³ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 26-28, 46-47, 93; *St Joseph Boys' Orphanage "Clontarf" Victoria Park, WA*, conducted by the Christian Brothers; Visitation Report, 1932, and Figure 2.15, as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

¹⁴ *Clontarf Property List*, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

¹⁵ Figure 2.10; Coldrey, op. cit., 26-35, 42; O'Doherty, Brother Pat, personal discussion, 2/8/1997; 'Clontarf Revisited' *Our Studies*, October 1946, pp. 9-11, as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

by the boys.¹⁷ Irrigation was provided via channels diverted from the creek. There was also a dairy, a poultry yard, piggery and stock runs. As a result, *Clontarf* was near self-sufficient. The grounds were fenced with post and rail fences, and picket fences all painted white.¹⁸ A number of outbuildings (most of which are no longer extant) had been constructed including a bakehouse, laundry, toilets, storerooms and a water tower.¹⁹ Two 1923 photographs shows the grounds in front of the building as substantially developed with lawns, garden beds, young trees and the statue of St Joseph.²⁰

Some time between 1926 and 1929, an area now referred to as 'Brother Keaney's Garden' was established, and this included a lake surrounded by palm trees.²¹ Brother Keaney was the Superior of *Clontarf* for two terms until 1942.²²

In a 1927 report, the Recreation Hall is first mentioned. This timber and iron hall was relocated from Mundaring Weir to *Clontarf* and erected south-west of the main building. In addition to general recreational activities, it was used as a gymnasium and had a stage at one end for presentations and performances, and later as a cinema. In 1940, the timber walls were replaced with brick. Also in 1927, hot showers were introduced to the home. In 1929, a bathroom block was added to the south-west of the main building.²³

In 1929, a grotto to honour Our Lady of Lourdes was constructed on the slope towards the Canning River. In 1954, this was moved to the south of the Chapel to make way for handball courts. The grave of student Michael Bowman, who was killed in a bus accident in 1955, is located behind the grotto.²⁴

By the late 1920s, a matron had been employed at *Clontarf*, and her quarters were located in a small building to the west of the main building.²⁵

In 1934, a change was to occur with the age of the boys residing at *Clontarf*. This was the result of the change of purpose for the Brothers' home, '*Castledare*', which changed from being a home for the intellectually handicapped into a junior orphanage, which took boys up to the age of nine.²⁶

Circa 1935, a small dormitory with a water tower - containing a concrete water tank - was built, south of the manual arts building. This was extended

¹⁷ From physical examination and from later aerial photographs included in the Allom Lovell Hocking report it can be seen that the south-eastern end of the site contains wetlands and is generally too low-lying to be farmed.

¹⁸ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 26-28, 46-47, 93; *St Joseph Boys' Orphanage "Clontarf" Victoria Park, WA*, op. cit.; Visitation Report, 1932, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

¹⁹ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 26-35, 42, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²⁰ Figures 2.9 & 2.10, as included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²¹ This area was a botanical garden and now forms part of the *System 6* and *Perth Bushplan* as contributing to the wetlands along the Canning River foreshore. <u>An independent</u> environmental assessment of Keaney Gardesn was commissioned by the Christian Brothers c1998, which is available for viewing at the Christian Brothers office.

²² The Christian Brothers' Associated Schemes for the Training of Poor Boys in Western Australia, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²³ Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²⁴ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²⁵ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 26-35, 42, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²⁶ Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 56-67, 213, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

in 1937, originally for classrooms, but becoming the Technical Trades Block. All brick work and most of the carpentry was done by the boys.²⁷

From 1936, under the direction of Superviser Brother Paul Keaney, *Clontarf* underwent probably its greatest phase of development to date both in the construction of further accommodation and facilities, as well as in the training schemes for the resident boys. In order to achieve this, Brother Keaney attracted generous donations of money, materials and services, as well as In addition, c.1936, Locations 14 substantial Lotteries Commission grants. and 15 were purchased, extending Clontarf's boundaries further westward, and 90 acres were purchased to the east. The boys were involved in the construction works, initially as assistance to the tradesmen, and then some moving on to becoming foremen and supervisors. This apprenticeship scheme resulted in many of the boys staying on beyond fourteen years of age, and then once they did leave Clontarf, greater opportunities for work were available to them. In 1936, the Chaplain's Residence was built on the east of the entrance avenue.²⁸

In 1937, the British child migrant scheme began but it was not until August 1938 that the first boys went to Christian Brothers' homes in Western Australia. The boys went to *Clontarf*, Bindoon and *Castledare*. By 1938, enrolments at *Clontarf* had increased to 208.²⁹ To accommodate the extra boys, a new classroom block was built, officially opening on 20 March 1938. This new block was designed by Howard, Bonner and Tracey and included a tower with small balconies, a library with a large fireplace in the western room, and a large handball court and later (1940) a tennis court.³⁰ Other works completed in the period 1938 to 1940 include a toilet block and a mechanics' workshop, ³¹ a bakehouse which included a clock tower, flour mill, laundry and servants' quarters,³² new entrance gates at the Manning Road end (with masonry walls and gate posts with wrought iron gates), and a pavilion on the oval (north).³³

A 1938 photograph shows the courtyard to the south of the main building with paved pathways, mounded garden beds, a timber framed gazebo, and a face brick clocktower. The courtyard gradually slopes towards the River.³⁴

In 1940, the dining and kitchen block was completed, containing the boys' dining room, Brothers' refectory, kitchen, refrigeration and storerooms.

²⁷ Figures 2.20 & 2.23, Coldrey, op. cit., p. 48; Visitation Report, 1937; 'The New Clontarf', *Our Studies*, October 1940, pp. 86-87, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²⁸ Clontarf Property List; Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 211-230; Visitation Reports, 1936-1940, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

²⁹ Visitation Report, 1938; Ryan, op. cit.; 'Boys' Town in West Australia', *Our Studies*, May 1940, pp. 17-18, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³⁰ Figures 2.24 & 2.28; stone in building; 'Additions to Clontarf' *Our Studies*, April 1939, pp. 18-20, as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³¹ Figure 2.29; Visitation Report, 1938; Boulter, op. cit.; 'The New Clontarf', op. cit., as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³² Figures 2.20 & 2.31; 'All in the day's work: The Clontarf Boys' Orphanage', *Western Mail*, 23/5/1940, pp. iv-v, 'The New Clontarf', op. cit., as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³³ Figures 2.32 & 2.33; 'The New Clontarf', op. cit.; 'Boys' Town in West Australia', op. cit., as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³⁴ Figure 2.20 in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

Originally the building had two towers, but today only the north-west tower remains.³⁵

In 1939-40, the timber verandahs were removed from the rear of the main building and replaced with concrete walled and jarrah floored verandahs on all but the north side of the building. Towers were also added at this time on the south-west and south-east corners, possibly being used as bedrooms for the older boys.³⁶

In 1940, a two-storey annex was added to the western side of the main building, resulting in the loss of the former matron's quarters. This annexe was later demolished. $^{\rm 37}$

At the end of 1940, foundations were laid for the much needed larger chapel, designed by architect, Marie Jackson. The majority of building works were carried out by *Clontarf* boys and Brothers. The rose window was apparently designed and manufactured in Ireland, and the original bell was a personal gift of the Archbishop. On 20 December 1941, the new chapel was consecrated, with an official opening ceremony held the following day. It was at this ceremony that the name 'Clontarf Boys' Town' was suggested.³⁸

Stone used in the construction of the chapel, some retaining walls and garden beds was donated by the O'Neil family who owned a large quarry in the Darling Scarp. The Christian Brothers had apparently assisted the O'Neil's in a time of financial or other crisis and the donation of stone was a demonstration of their gratitude.³⁹

During the Second World War, on 1 March 1942, the RAAF took occupation of *Clontarf.* The Brothers and boys were relocated to the farms at Bindoon and Tardun.⁴⁰ On 1 February 1945, the RAAF moved out. Although some buildings were added to the site by the RAAF during its occupation, much furniture and equipment belonging to *Clontarf* has been either lost or destroyed, and the farm and grounds had become neglected. Upon returning to *Clontarf*, the Brothers and the boys set about bringing the institution back to what it was before the war, which was not an easy process as materials and equipment were difficult to obtain in the early post-war years.⁴¹

In 1947, the main building was renovated, including retiling of the roof, receiling the dormitories with plasterboard, repainting, plumbing works

³⁵ 'The New Clontarf', op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³⁶ Figures 2.36-2.38; 'The New Clontarf', op. cit.; 'Boys' Town in West Australia', op. cit.; Boulter, op. cit.; Visitation Report, 1940, 'The Mustard Seed that has Developed into "Boys' Town, Clontarf W.A.', *The Christian Brothers' Educational Record*, 1942, pp. 196-207, as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³⁷ This annex was not of a high quality and, in 1966, the roof of collapsed. 'The New Clontarf', op. cit.; Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Visitation Reports 1956 & 1965; as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³⁸ Visitation Report 1940; 'The New Clontarf', op. cit.; 'The Mustard Seed that has Developed into "Boys' Town, op. cit.; Dally, A. C., 'The Stained Glass Windows of Clontarf, WA", *Christian Brothers' Studies*, May 1978, pp. 66-68; 'Solemn Consecration of Clontarf Chapel' *Record*, 25/12/1941 (extract); as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

³⁹ Conversation between Alice Steedman and Brother Tuppin, 26/4/00.

⁴⁰ 'New Chapel at Clontarf', *Our Studies*, May 1942, pp. 57-60; Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 49, 141, 147, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁴¹ Visitation Report, 1940; Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid. Information on the RAAF occupation of *Clontarf* is available at the National Archives of Australia, Perth office.

(including returning the bathroom facilities to the main building) and other repairs. $^{\rm 42}$

Other works carried out after the War included the renovation and upgrade of the Dining and Kitchen block (1949-50), the reopening of the bakery (1948), reinstatement of partitions in the classroom block (1951) and re-equipping of the Technical block (1951-52). In 1949, an outdoor stage/auditorium designed by the architect, Edgar Henderson, was erected in the quadrangle.⁴³

Some of the former RAAF buildings left on site were utilised by the Brothers after the War, and the remainder were progressively demolished.⁴⁴ Circa 1948, one was converted into a convent for the Sisters, and named St Patrick's.⁴⁵ In 1950, two huts were moved to the east of the dining and kitchen block and used as an infirmary and surgery and staff quarters.⁴⁶ (In the early 1990s, these huts were demolished.⁴⁷)

Works to the grounds and gardens and the farm were also carried out in the period immediately after the War. The palms along the entrance avenue and in front of the main building were replaced with roses and other flowering shrubs. In 1950, the quadrangle was cemented and a picket fence erected from the rear of the quadrangle to the convent.⁴⁸ The farm was brought back to its pre-War state with clearing and fencing as well as improvements to the building and the building of a new dairy (1951).⁴⁹

In 1952, the artist Antony Paraphilaekos [sic] was commissioned to paint a mural of the crucifixion on the dome of the sanctuary.⁵⁰

A significant change to occur after the War that was to have a direct effect on *Clontarf*, was the Education Department's reorganisation and increased provision of secondary education in line with developments in other countries - particularly Britain.⁵¹ This meant that many of the boys were now sitting for their Junior Certificate at *Clontarf*, which previously had been undertaken at nearby Aquinas College. Some also went on to complete their Leaving at Aquinas while still residing at *Clontarf*. In addition, there was an influx of British and Maltese migrants from the late 1940s early 1950s. These two events resulted in an increase in residential numbers, which peaked at 249 in 1953.⁵²

- ⁴⁶ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.
- ⁴⁷ Allom, Lovell Hocking, ibid.
- ⁴⁸ Visitation Report, 1964; Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

Register of Heritage Places - Assessment Doc'n 14/12/2001

⁴² Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Visitation Reports, 1947 & 1962; *Clontarf: founded 1901. The Portals through which 2,451 Orphan Youth have passed to become worthy citizens of our State*; Clontarf Christmas card, 1967, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁴³ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Coldrey, op. cit., p. 147; Visitation Reports, 1951 & 1964; *Clontarf: Founded 1901*, ibid, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁴⁴ Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁴⁵ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Coldrey, op. cit., p. 417; O'Doherty, Brother Pat, personal discussion, 2/8/1997, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁴⁹ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Ryan, Brother Kevin, *Brief Overview: History of Clontarf*, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁵⁰ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; *Clontarf Chapel of St. John Bosco*, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁵¹ Gregory, Jenny and Smith, Lisa (Centre for WA History), A *Thematic History of Public Education in Western Australia*, prepared for the Building Management Authority, 1995, p. 41.

⁵² Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 137-138; Ryan, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, op. cit.

By 1953, an area of 50 acres north of Manning (Fremantle) Road was taken on a lease. Plans of the area dated 1933 and 1953 show the area extending north from *Clontarf* to Jarrah Road and east to what is now Collier Park had been reserved for pine plantation. Many remnant trees of this plantation still exist in this area.⁵³

In 1954, following the death of Brother Keaney, the recreation hall underwent a major renovation, including a new brick facade, and was renamed the Keaney Memorial Hall.⁵⁴

In 1957, another memorial was established in honour of the founder of the Christian Brothers - Brother Edmund Rice. A garden, including a statue of Brother Rice, a rose garden and a pond, was developed between the presbytery and Manning Road.⁵⁵

Between 1957 and 1958 several works occurred. In 1957, the former mechanics' workshop was renovated and converted into a gymnasium. In 1958, a new garage was built. On 7 March 1958, the first swimming pool was opened at *Clontarf.*⁵⁶

During the 1960s, another change to the numbers at *Clontarf* came about with the introduction of dayboys - including Aboriginal boys and the acceptance of boarders from the country.⁵⁷ At this time, the playing fields were enlarged (1960)⁵⁸ and a new laundry was built north of the dining block, including a flat for the matron on the northern side (1962)⁵⁹. In 1963, a roof which spanned from the hall locker room and recently renovated toilet block was completed designed by architects, Henderson and Thompson.⁶⁰ In 1964 the first lot of pine trees were cleared, new tennis courts provided and two new entrances to the river ovals were erected.⁶¹

The 1960s also saw the beginning of the selling off of *Clontarf* land by the Brothers. In 1964, the eastern end of *Clontarf* was sold to the Housing Commission. In the late 1960s, the lease of land north of Manning Road, which had been used as playing fields, was given over to the Western Australian Institute of Technology (WAIT now Curtin University of Technology).⁶² In 1966, the Sisters vacated their convent, which was then

Clontarf

⁵³ *Clontarf Property List*; Young, *Clontarf Boys' Town*, Fig. 2.17 and Fig. 2.18, as cited/included in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.; the Allom Lovell Hocking report does not detail whether or not the plantation was related to Clontarf although Figure 2.49 shows 'Clontarf pine plantation' (1938 booklet).

⁵⁴ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Visitation Report, 1951; Coldrey, op. cit., p. 147, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁵⁵ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁵⁶ The floor of the gym was converted to wood in 1969. Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Visitation Report, 1964, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁵⁷ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 137-138; Ryan, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.; Conversation between Robert Eggington and Alice Steedman, 9/5/00, - some Aboriginal children were placed at Clontarf prior to 1960 although Sister Kate's in St James catered exclusively for the placement of the 'stolen generation'. Clontarf's role was basically educational although it followed popular assimilationist policies of the day.

⁵⁸ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁵⁹ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Visitation Report, 1962; O'Doherty, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶⁰ Henderson & Thompson Architects, 'Clontarf Boys' Town; proposed new works', 1962; Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶¹ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Visitation Report, 1964, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶² Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; White, Michael, WAIT to Curtin: A History of the Western Australian Institute of Technology, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

renovated and turned into a hostel, named Jackson House.⁶³ The hostel was used by both WAIT students and senior boys.⁶⁴

The 1970s were a transition period for *Clontarf*. In 1973, it was announced that *Clontarf* was to move toward becoming a treatment centre for adolescents with problems. From 1977, very few day boys were enrolled, and by the 1980s, the number of resident boys had more than halved.⁶⁵

As well as changes to the enrolments, there were changes to the buildings and grounds to accommodate its new role. In 1972, the dormitories on the first floor of the eastern wing of the main building were modernised. At the same time, new individual cubicles, which incorporated bathroom facilities, were built to accommodate 21 boys, as well as a self contained flat for the Brother in charge.⁶⁶

The chapel also underwent several changes during the 1970s. In 1972, two stained glass panels from the original chapel in the main building were incorporated into the chapel doors, and between 1974-1978, the original chapel windows were replaced with five new stained windows.⁶⁷

Inevitably, there was also a loss of some elements at this time, not only because some of the buildings were no longer required, but also because of changes occurring outside the site and because some had not aged as well as others and were beyond repair. In 1971, land was resumed and the gates and wall on the northern side of Manning Road were demolished due to road widening. In 1971, the outdoor stage/auditorium (1949) was demolished, and not long after the pavilion (c.1940) was demolished.⁶⁸ In 1972, the verandahs on the eastern and western sides of the main building were demolished and the old working boys' quarters were demolished. ⁶⁹ Circa 1974, the manual arts building was demolished to make way for the new science and library building. This building, designed by Henderson and Thompson, was completed in 1975.⁷⁰

In 1980, the pond and most of the garden beds were removed from Brother Rice's Garden. $^{71}\,$

⁶³ Joseph Jackson was a former student of Clontarf, who became a teacher and bandmaster of Clontarf, cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶⁴ From 1981-1986, this building was used by the Multiple Sclerosis Society. *Clontarf*, September 1971; Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Hann, Peter, 'Dates of Arrival on Clontarf Campus -Aboriginal Organisations - as at 11/9/1997'; JB & ME Thompson Architects, 'Transportable Classrooms and Toilets for Abmusic', 1990, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, op. cit.

⁶⁵ Ryan, op. cit.; Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Coldrey, op. cit., pp. 174-176, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶⁶ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; *Clontarf*, December 1973; Clontarf Christmas Card 1967, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶⁷ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; *Clontarf Chapel of St. John Bosco*; Dally, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶⁸ Some of the rubble from these demolitions was used to fill in the low lying areas in order to control the mosquito problem. This was done in 1972 under instruction from the city of South Perth. Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁶⁹ Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; *Clontarf*, December 1973, Clontarf Christmas Card 1967, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁷⁰ The library and science building was made possible through funding by the Commonwealth Government. Plaque on building; Clontarf Annals, 1945-1975; Henderson & Thompson Architects, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

In 1981, the first stage of the Waterford residential development was released for sale. 72

In 1985, a second Brothers' residence was built by Westrend Homes to the north of the presbytery, which had also been converted into a Brothers' residence by this time.⁷³

In the late 1980s, allegations of sexual and physical abuse and exploitation were made against the Christian Brothers by former students/residents of their institutions. An organisation named 'Voices' was established by former students/residents to represent and provide counselling for those who had experienced abuse at the Christian Brothers' orphanages.⁷⁴

The Christian Brothers accepted that there was strong evidence that many of the allegations were true, and made a public apology. A legal action brought by over 200 former students, which ran from 1993 in the New South Wales Supreme Court was settled out of court in 1996.⁷⁵ The existence of many of the buildings at Christian Brothers institutions built by staff and children under their supervision is a tangible reminder of the perceived exploitation of the former residents.

In 1983, the treatment Centre for Adolescents closed which prompted two years of study and community consultation, which led to the decision to reopen, a school for Aboriginal youths aged 15 to 18.⁷⁶ On 2 May 1986, Clontarf Aboriginal College was officially opened in the main building. This college was non-residential and initially utilised most of the ground floor of the main building, the classroom block, the library block and had the use of the technical block and the gymnasium.⁷⁷

Aboriginal children from all over the state attended the College. With increased use by the Aboriginal community generally, many fledgling Aboriginal organisations were offered low cost rental arrangements to utilise other buildings on the site. Marr Mooditj Foundation Health Worker Training College has occupied the first floor of the main building and Abmusic has occupied Jackson house since 1987. Since 1988, the Aboriginal Dance Development Unit has used the Keaney Memorial Hall, which had to be modified to include large mirrors.⁷⁸ From 1990, Dumbartung (an Aboriginal arts organisation) has occupied the former locker room, as both a studio and as offices although it was on site since 1988.⁷⁹ In 1993, Skillshare (formerly known as the Clontarf Aboriginal College Employment Training Program) moved into the former laundry and matron's quarters.⁸⁰ Since 1994, the

⁷² 'New riverside land to be boom suburb', *Weekend News*, 17/10/1981, p. 32, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁷³ Westrend Homes, 'Proposed Residence for the Christian Brothers', Clontarf, 1985, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁷⁴ Blyth, Bruce, Counting the Cost:: Christian Brothers & Child Care in Australian Orphanages, P&B Press, Como WA 1999, p.1 in Documentation of Places for Entry in the Register of Heritage Places Catholic Agricultural College, Bindoon.

⁷⁵ Documentation of Places for Entry in the Register of Heritage Places Catholic Agricultural College, Bindoon.

⁷⁶ Information provided by Br. Tony Shanahan, July 2000

⁷⁷ Plaque in main building; Bowler, Brother L. L., *Clontarf Re-visited*, 1995; Hann, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁷⁸ Bowler, ibid; Hann, ibid, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁷⁹ ibid.

⁸⁰ Plaque on Skillshare building; Bowler, op. cit.; Hann, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

Aboriginal Development Foundation for Sport and Recreation WA occupied the former dining room.⁸¹

The Brothers retained the use of the chapel and their two residences. In 1991, an extension designed by M. Rodic and Associates was added to the north side of the north residence.⁸² The statue of St Joseph, which was damaged and partly replaced in 1992, was shifted closer to the residences.⁸³

In 1992, the bakehouse was demolished in preparation for the Waterford subdivision $^{\rm 84}$

In 1994, *Clontarf* was listed in the City of South Perth's Municipal Inventory of Heritage Buildings and Places as a Category 2 level of significance. The listing of 'Clontarf Boys' Town and precinct' included: Chapel; Brother Keaney Gardens; Boys' Town areas. *Clontarf* has also been listed in the City of South Perth's Town Planning Scheme No. 5 (List of Buildings, Objects and Places considered to be worthy of preservation).⁸⁵

In 1996, a Conservation Plan for the site was commissioned by the Christian Brothers' with the assistance of a Lotteries Commission Grant.⁸⁶

In 1998, a new building was constructed for Abmusic Aboriginal and Islander College of Music at the north-west corner of the site. It was designed by architect Michael Ipkendanz.⁸⁷

In 1999, the western and southern wings of the former technical trades building and the upper hand ball courts were demolished to make way for a new building for Marr Mooditj Foundation Aboriginal Health Workers College. The building was in a very poor condition and had serious structural faults. Extensive conservation work was carried out on the eastern portion of the building so that it could be retained and re-used by Marr Mooditj. The new building is currently under construction.⁸⁸

For some years the Christian Brothers have been negotiating with local Aboriginal elders to arrange for a mechanism by which the site can be gifted to the Aboriginal community. An initial announcement about The Christian Brothers' intention to hand over the property was firs mad in December 1993, as part of the International Year of Indigenous Peoples. The Brothers propose to retain the Brothers' residence, former presbytery, chapel and wetlands by forming a separate title for the remainder of the site.⁸⁹

In 2000, the site is occupied by predominantly Aboriginal community controlled organisations inlcuding Marr Mooditj, Abmusic, Dumbartung, and Noolbenger. The Christian Brothers' interest in the site is retained through the Clontarf Aboriginal College and the retired Brothers' residences on the

⁸¹ Bowler, op. cit.; Hann, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁸² M. Rodic & Associates Design Consultants, 'Proposed Addition to Clontarf Residence', 1991, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁸³ Bowler, op. cit.; Hann, op. cit., as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁸⁴ City of South Perth, Planning, personal discussion, 29/7/1997; Allbrook, Malcolm and Richard Hammond, *The Future of Clontarf: Development Proposals for the College Board of Clontarf Aboriginal College*, 1990, as cited in Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁸⁵ Allom Lovell Hocking, ibid.

⁸⁶ HCWA file, extract from Lotteries Commission report, December 1996.

⁸⁷ HCWA file, Development Committee approval 23/6/98.

⁸⁸ HCWA File various correspondences 1999-2000.

⁸⁹ Site plans included in Allom Lovell Hocking report shows proposed subdivision line. Information from Br. Tony Shanahan, July 2000 states that a new single title boundary has been approved but not adopted as yet.

eastern side of the site. The Brothers also have a role as coordinators of maintenance, leasing and overall development of the campus. The Chapel is only used occasionally by the Brothers and is leased periodically to another Christian organisation.

13. 2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

Clontarf is located on the southern side of Manning Road adjacent to the Canning River. The area to the west of the site is a developing residential area containing generally two-storey housing on lots of around 500 square metres. This area was once part of the *Clontarf* farm.

The area to the east is generally low lying wetlands fed by the Canning River and a fresh water spring. Curtin University of Technology and residential areas of the 1950's and 60's are located to the north.

The site presents as a collection of buildings of assorted design, style and purpose, arranged around the centrepiece of the original 1901 building, central driveway and adjacent lawn areas. Most of the buildings are quite closely placed, with the exception of those used by Abmusic which are more remote at the north-west corner of the site. The southern portion of the site is low lying land adjacent to the Canning River containing the old sports ground, Hand Ball Courts and Keaney Gardens.

The site is unified by a number of similar wall/gate features containing semicircular entry statements, tall pillars and/or low machicolated or solid walls constructed in smooth or roughcast rendered painted brickwork. These elements are located at three of the entrances from Manning Road, at the north-east and south-east ends of the Chapel and at the termination of the path which leads from the courtyard south of the main building to the sports ground.

The main entrance walls were re-built in 1998 and the piers restored. The piers are each topped with a crucifix and have a niche on their front face. Decorative wrought iron gates span the central driveway and two pedestrian access points. The entries immediately to the east and west are simply retailed and a further entry at the west of the site only has two piers.

The wall elements adjacent to the chapel have machicolated walls to echo the Romanesque detailing of the chapel. In each of these elements a short flight of brick steps leads from the upper (building) level down to the eastern driveway where the wall curve around to create semicircular spaces at the base of the steps. The southern wall element also has a further wall with arched openings on the eastern side of the driveway. These elements are in a very poor condition.

A final curved wall element adjacent to the sports ground is in a very poor condition, half of it being demolished during sewerage upgrade works in 1999. The remnant wall is similar in detail to the secondary entries from Manning Road.

The central driveway is flanked by an avenue of rose gardens and mature trees both native and exotic, and is terminated in front of the main building with a mounded roundabout containing a large specimen Norfolk Island Pine. Garden beds are also located in front of the main building and adjacent to the Church. A border of small cypress tress flanks the eastern side of the Church and the remnants of an old pine plantation are located near the Abmusic building. More mature trees are located along the edge of the bank which falls down to the sports ground including a grove of Moreton Bay figs near the former technical trades building.

The site also features a number of statues and memorials including a statue of Christian Brothers' founder Edmund Rice located north of the Brothers' residence and statues of the Virgin Mary and St Joseph located in the central lawn area. A small grotto is located at the north end of the Chapel and a grave with associated timber gazebo and low concrete block and terracotta tile walls is located in the lawn to the east of the main building.

Other structures in the grounds include an electrical substation, clock tower, handball courts, swimming pool, basketball courts and retaining walls.

The swimming pool and handball courts are located on the bank that leads down to the sports ground. There are five large handball courts cut into the side of the bank, constructed in rendered brickwork. Five smaller courts and two trampoline pits, which were located behind these at an upper level, were demolished in late 1999. The swimming pool is located immediately to the west of the handball courts, the other side of a central path which leads to the sports ground. The pool is fully tiled below ground and is currently unused. Both the pool and handball courts are in a poor condition. A stepped brick retaining wall runs along the northern side of the pool enclosure and continues along the northern boundary of the former small handball courts to a driveway adjacent to the former gymnasium. A random stone wall with raised mortar joints retains the driveway as it leads down to the sports ground. The brick retaining wall is in a poor condition.

A steel rod sign dedicating the sports ground is located within one of the lower ball courts.

The basket ball courts are located immediately south of the courtyard south of the main building. These are in poor to average condition. The courtyard and surrounding area is sealed with bitumen over concrete pavers. A new building is being constructed for Marr Mooditj Foundation immediately east of the basketball courts on the site of a portion of the former Technical Trades building. A clock tower is located in the centre of the courtyard and basketball court area. It is simply detailed in rendered and painted brickwork. It is octagonal in plan and tapers towards to top. It has clock faces on the north and south sides and the base has been decorated in Aboriginal graphics.

An electrical substation constructed of random stone walling with a hipped terracotta tiled roof is located in the central lawn area.

Keaney Gardens located adjacent to the Canning River were not inspected as part of this assessment; however, they do contain a significant portion of remnant vegetation from the original gardens.

The physical description of the buildings will follow in a clockwise direction from the north-east corner of the site. Plans of the buildings have been provided from the Conservation Plan. Not all buildings have been inspected internally.

Brothers' Residence (1985)

This building is located in the gardens on the eastern side of the main driveway. It originally provided four bedrooms and shared living areas for the brothers but was extended in 1991 to provide a further self contained flat at the northern end, connected to the original building by a covered walkway. The building has face brick walls, a low-pitched hipped, tiled roof and exposed eaves timbers. It has aluminium framed sliding windows and appears to be in good condition.

Former Presbytery/Chaplain's Residence (1936; 1973)

This residence is located on the eastern side of the central driveway between the Chapel and the Brother's Residence.

The former Presbytery is a brick bungalow with a hipped terracotta tiled roof. It has verandahs under the main pitch of the roof on the north and east sides. The north side has been enclosed to form a sunroom. The verandah walls and piers are in rusticated limestone, and pairs of square timber verandah posts support the roof. The windows are lead-light timber casements. A brick addition with aluminium framed sliding windows has been added to the south east corner of the residence. This building was not inspected internally.

Chapel (1940-41; 1972; 1974-78)

The chapel is located to the north-east of the main building on the eastern side of the central driveway. It replaced an earlier chapel located in the main building.

The chapel is an Inter-War Romanesque⁹⁰ styled rendered brick building with a terracotta tiled roof concealed behind parapet gables on the north and south ends. A narrow tower with an arcaded belfry and hipped roof is located in the south-east corner. The apse projects beyond the gable at the north end of the building. Two porches, also containing the robing room and sacristy, project from the east and west sides of the building adjacent to the sanctuary. Both are entered via a set of semi-circular brick steps. A small confessional projects from the east wall of the nave. The top faces of the parapet gables and the parapet wall of the confessionals are tiled. The long walls have attached buttress piers.

All windows and doors are set in round arched openings accentuated by a rendered hood mould detail on the surrounding wall. The windows are leadlight and the doors are in diagonal set v-jointed boarding. Original windows on the south façade have been replaced with specially dedicated windows. The raking arches motif is used below the parapet cornice on the south façade and the machicolation motif below the gutter line on the east and west sides of the building. A large rose window with stained leaded glass is located centrally on the south façade.

The base of the tower contains the foundation stone and a dedication to the O'Neil family. Two sun shading devices have been installed over windows on the west façade.

Internally, the building has plastered walls above dado height and painted ruled ashlar render below. The floor of the entry porch and baptistery is herringbone brickwork whilst the floor of the remainder of the church is herringbone parquetry using local timbers including jarrah, karri, sheoak, and banksia. A set of narrow concrete stairs leading to the bell tower and choir stalls is located on the south side of the entry porch. A small stone baptismal font is located on the north side of the entry porch.

The exposed roof trusses have decorative carving on the base members, flanges and pendulum posts. The ceiling above is in diagonal v-jointed

⁹⁰ Apperly, Richard, Irving, Robert, Reynolds, Peter *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present* Angus & Robertson, North Ryde, 1989, pp.194-6.

boarding. Handmade metal and glass lanterns are suspended from the trusses. The dome over the sanctuary has a large painting depicting the crucifixion. The edge of the paper upon which the central image was painted is starting to deteriorate.

The altar and reredos are set out from the rear wall of the sanctuary. The altar has three arches set between small attached piers whilst the reredos has a central tower and dome flanked by wall elements, all set between raking walls with curved integrated piers set either side of the altar.

Timber pews are set either side of the central aisle. The choir stalls contain simple timber bench seats. The robing room and sacristy are simply detailed and contain original timber cabinetwork.

The bell fry arcades are screened with chicken wire and there is some evidence of reinforcement corrosion on the steps and wall leading up to the bell platform.

The building is in very good condition for its age and construction.

Library (1974-75)

The Library in located at the south-east corner of the main building. It was constructed as a library and science block and is currently used by Clontarf Aboriginal College as a library and computer room.

The Library is a long rectangular concrete block building with a tiled gable roof. Pre-cast concrete box gutters obscure the eaves on the north and south elevations. The doors and windows are aluminium framed. The building is in a good condition.

Gymnasium (former) (1938; 1957; 1962)

The Gymnasium is located at the south-east corner of the site on the edge of the embankment leading down to the foreshore and the adjacent wetlands. It was constructed as a mechanics workshop and changed to a Gymnasium in 1957 which involved bricking in of the lower part of windows and alterations to doorways. The timber floor was added in 1962. It is currently used as a timber workshop by one of the resident Christian Brothers.

The building is similar in construction to the classroom block having face brick to dado height and rendered above. The facades are divided by massive brick piers, in between which are large panels of windows. The sill height is higher than the face brick dado which tends to confirm the documentary evidence. The building has a hipped tiled roof with small gable over a projecting bay on the southern elevation. A small brick store with a low-pitched steel roof has been added to the southern end of the hall. The windows and doors are all in a poor condition. Most sashes have been removed and the windows meshed over.

Internally, the building is in poor to average condition. It has an exposed king-post roof truss system including hip-trusses and there is no evidence of the building ever having a ceiling. There is termite damage to the doors and frames at the south end of the building.

Former Technical Trades Building (1935-37)

This building is located to the south-east of the main building, south of the Library and west of the former Gymnasium. It was constructed in stages from 1935-37. The north-eastern and southern wings of the building were

demolished in late 1999 and conservation works carried out on the remaining portion including the original water tower and classroom/dormitory.

The former technical trades building (portion) consists of a large room and a tower located at its north-west corner. The building has a hipped terracotta tiled roof with gables over the centre of the southern and eastern facades and adjacent to the tower on the northern façade. Emblems of the Christian Brothers are located on the walls of each gable. The southern and eastern facades have face brickwork to sill height and rendered brickwork above. The northern façade and tower have a rendered band at sill level and face brick extending up _ the height of the windows, then rendered brickwork above. The tower has two narrow bands of face brickwork, the lower being tuck-pointed. The upper level of the tower contains a reinforced concrete water tank which is rendered externally. He building has timber framed double pivot-hung sash windows. All tiles, and eaves linings, gutters and downpipes have been renewed and paint stripped from the render and face brickwork. Most fascias, barges and windows have also been replaced with new materials to the original design. A portion of the northern wall has been re-built. This is now rendered externally.

Internally, the building has been gutted; the floor structure has been replaced and roof repaired. The building will have a new fitout as part of its conversion to a classroom for Marr Mooditj Foundation Health Worker Training College.

Main Building (1901; 1939-40; 1947; 1972)

The main building is located at the termination of the central driveway. It was constructed in 1901 as the St Joseph's Orphanage.

This two-storey Victorian Romanesque⁹¹ style rusticated limestone building has a terracotta-tiled roof set behind parapet gables. It has a symmetrical façade with arcaded verandahs at first and second floor in between the gable ends. The building has brick detailing around windows, doors, elliptical arches of the ground floor arcade, first floor verandah balustrade, string-courses and chimneys. Some of the brick detail has been rendered over.

The first floor verandah has paired columns above the brick balustrade supporting the large verandah beam. A detail of timber dentils is visible below the gutter line. Three small square openings in the balustrade between each column pair are filled with a simple timber star detail.

All windows and doors are set in square openings except for two large arched openings at first floor level in the prominent north facing gables. The large arched openings have a rendered hood-mould, sill and drip-mould. Four sets of three awning windows are set within a timber frame containing four small arches below vertical mullions at the top of the arch. The gables have a rendered coping and are topped with a cross. The arches of the ground floor arcade also have rendered hood mould and decorative drip stops.

The building is basically u-shaped and a two-storey verandah surrounds central courtyard at the rear of the building and extends across the southern faces of the two side wings. The verandahs are terminated at the junction between the limestone building and two rendered brick towers with hipped terracotta tiled roofs set just outside the external building line of the limestone building. The verandah is constructed in reinforced concrete and rendered brickwork. A steel and concrete fire escape stair is located in the south east corner of the courtyard. The verandah has a timber floor at first floor level. Some of the limestone has been painted over with a cement-based paint and repairs in rendered brickwork made to look like the limestone have been made to the west wall. Original windows are double hung timber sashes with a central glazing bead. Some have been replaced with aluminium frames. Original doors are multi-paneled in solid timber or half-glazed French doors. Some of these have also been replaced with flush panel doors or filled with aluminium framed windows with solid base panels.

The exterior of the building is in poor to average condition for its age. The limestone requires conservation and parapets require stabilising. The roof tiles are starting to decay and most timber-work requires urgent work. The concrete verandah and rendered brick towers are intrusive on the appreciation of the earlier fabric.

The main entry to the building is located on the ground floor verandah. Secondary entries are located on the eastern side of the building and also from a number of doors within the courtyard at ground and first floor level. The main entry hall leads into a stair lobby, which contains a simple timber staircase with turned balusters and newel posts. A timber-paneled store is located under the stair. A door at the base of the stair leads to the rear courtyard. Corridors lead to the secondary entrance at the east and to a large room to the west. Arches are located at the junction of the entry hall and stair lobby, and at the beginning and centre of the east corridor. The timber floors are carpeted and the area has been recently painted to an earlier colour scheme. The first floor stair lobby also has arches at the junctions of corridors leading to the front verandah and eastern rooms. All arches have decorative plaster corbels.

Doors and windows generally have reeded timber architraves and square corner stops containing a circular pattern. Skirting blocks are generally plain chamfered and deep skirtings have a reeded detail at the base and curved moulding at the top.

The eastern side of the ground floor generally contains small rooms, which are used for office, whereas the first floor east wing has been divided into small offices with timber partitions. Larger rooms are located at the south end of the east wings, the western side of the central wing and in the west wing on both ground and first floor. These large spaces are currently used as classroom and gallery spaces. Ground floor space generally feature high ceilings with small scotia trim or no cornice at all. Some rooms have decorative plaster vents and narrow timber picture rails. The first floor rooms in the eastern wing have suspended ceilings below original ceiling height.

Generally the interior is in a fair condition considering its age and use although much of the original fabric is lost or obscured. The first floor rooms have been recently renovated and repainted.

Toilets are located at the south ends of the east and west wings and at the north end of the west wing on the ground floor. On the first floor they are located centrally on the east wing adjacent to the verandah and at the east end of the central wing. Most toilets are in a poor condition due to their age and construction.

Classroom Block (1937-38; c1961; 1964)

The classroom block is located to the south-west of the main building on the edge of the embankment which leads down to the sports ground. It was constructed in 1937-38 to provide classrooms, library and handball court. By

1961, verandah piers had been replaced and the handball court was converted to a squash court in 1964.

The building is constructed of rendered and face-brick and has a hipped tiled roof. In plan the building is essentially U-shaped with the long axis being in the centre of the "U" and extending along an east-west axis. A tower is located centrally along this axis. The tower has a hipped tiled roof and concrete cantilever balconies projecting to the east and west.

The northern wing of the building is a former handball court has a flat steel roof and has been bricked in at the north end forming a squash court. Seven classrooms are located in the remainder of the building and are accessed via a covered walkway which runs around the east and south side of the central courtyard. The walkway has face brick piers and a low-pitched corrugated steel roof. Small highlight windows punctuate the wall of the building above the walkway.

The southern elevation and the room to the north-east corner have large aluminium framed windows between solid masonry piers.

The building appears to be in good condition for its age.

Keaney Memorial Hall, former shower block and toilets (Recreation Hall) (c.1927; 1938; 1940; 1954; 1960; 1963)

The Recreation Hall is located on the western side of the main building. The Hall, which was originally timber framed with an iron roof, was apparently brought to the site from Mundaring Weir c.1927. The toilet block to the west of the hall was constructed in 1938. The shower block is probably that constructed in 1929 also referred to as a bathroom block. In 1940, the walls of the hall were replaced with brick and in 1951, the shower block was converted into a locker room. In 1954, a new brick façade was added to the east elevation, an additional set of double doors were added to the south elevation and a tuck-shop installed at the eastern end of the hall. The former shower block was renovated in 1960 and the toilet block in 1987. A roof was also constructed to join the three buildings in 1963.

Dumbartung have occupied the former shower block since 1996, and the hall was used by Aboriginal Dance Development Unit from 1988 to 1998. The toilets are still used by staff, students and visitors to the site.

The building consists of three building joined by a steel framed and sheeted covered way. The hall has rendered brick walls, a gabled tiled roof and timber framed double-hung sash windows. The former shower block has a tiled gable roof with three large south lights projecting up beyond the ridge. The walls are rendered and painted and windows are a variety of aluminium and timber frames. The toilet block has a hipped tiled roof and rendered brick walls. The eastern elevations of the hall and former shower block have face brick stepped parapet walls. The wall on the east of the hall has a bust of Brother Keaney and a mosaic of Mother of Perpetual Succour.

Internally, the hall has a timber floor, face brickwork to dado height, and a cambered ceiling.

The hall, former shower block and toilets appear in fair-poor condition for their age and considering the number of alterations to the fabric. Timber windows, barge boards and fascias are rotten and roof timbers show serious deflection. The steel roof joining the three building is badly corroded.

Garage/work shop (1958; 1998)

The workshop is located on the south side of the east-west driveway, south-west of the former Dining Room/Kitchen.

The workshop consists of a rendered brick building with a low pitched steel roof set behind a small parapet on the western end of the northern elevation, and a stepped parapet on the eastern elevation. Four large openings are filled with steel roll type doors. New aluminium framed windows have been installed on the eastern elevation. The building was modified and renovated in 1998 and is in good condition.

Former Kitchen and Dining Room (1939-40; 1949-50; 1951; 1957; 1969)

This building is located at south-west corner of the central lawn area, at the junction of the western secondary driveway and the road which runs east-west across the front of the main building. It originally contained dining rooms from the boys and Brothers, a kitchen, storerooms and cool rooms. A tower on the south-west corner was removed and the ceilings and floor replaced in the boys dining room in 1949-50. In 1951 the Brothers dining room was renovated and a new cool room installed and in 1957 the kitchen was renovated. The front of the building was tuckpointed in 1969.

The boys'dining room has been used as the site conference room since 1991. Lake Jasper project used the Brothers' Dining Room in 1991 and it has been used by Aboriginal Development Foundation for Sport and Recreation since 1994.

The former Kitchen and Dining Room building is a U-shaped building with a gabled terracotta tiled roof, rendered brick walls with face brick up to sill height. A small portion of the brickwork has been tuck-pointed. A tower with a hipped roof is located at the north-west corner of the building. The main elevation (east) of the building is characterised by two dominant bricked gables and a timber framed verandah with a corrugated steel roof which runs the entire length of the elevation. The verandah floor is concreted. Most of the windows in the building are timber framed double-hung sash windows. The internal courtyard of the U-shape has a skillion roof verandah in terracotta tiles, most of which has been enclosed. The courtyard is paved in concrete and a small set of steps lead down to a pathway along the rear of the building.

The building is generally in a poor condition with horizontal cracking evident in the walls above window heads, adjacent to eave lines and in the gables. These problems are variously due to corroding lintels, inadequate structural stability in the brick gables and major deformation of roof timbers.

Former Matron's Residence and former Laundry (Noolbenger) (1952; 1962)

These buildings are located on the western side of the central lawn area adjacent to the secondary driveway between the former Kitchen/dining room and Jackson House. The laundry was constructed in 1952 and the residence in 1962. The buildings have been used by Noolbenger (formerly Skillshare) since 1993.

The former Matron's Residence has a low-pitched terracotta tiled gable roof, face brickwork and aluminium framed sliding sash windows. The northern façade has been painted. It is in a good condition despite being modified from residence to offices.

The former laundry has rendered brick walls and timber framed windows and a gable roof. It is located at the south-west corner of the residence. A lean to verandah on the southern side has been partly enclosed in shade cloth. It is in a generally poor condition.

Transportable (Lake Jasper)

This building is located to the north of the former Matron's Residence. It was brought to the site in 1992 and has not been assessed.

Jackson House (Abmusic) (c.1942)

This building is also located on the western side of the central lawn area adjacent to the secondary driveway. It was brought to the site by the RAAF during World War II and was since used as a convent (c1948-1966), hostel (1966-81), MS Society (1981-86) and Abmusic College (1986-1999). It is currently used by Abmusic Aboriginal Corporation Inc. for offices, community arts development and student common room.

It is a collection of three timber framed weatherboard and asbestos cement sheet gable roofed buildings, joined in an east-west alignment through the central building containing the toilets. The eastern and western buildings are divided into small rooms, with only one larger space existing in the south west corner of the western building.

Externally, the building is in a generally poor condition with problems such as decaying asbestos cement sheet roof, rotten timber stumps, weatherboards and window frames and corroded gutters and downpipes. Internally the building requires some refurbishment but provides adequate amenity for community arts purposes.

Abmusic Building (1998-9)

Located at the north-western corner of the site and having its main entry facing south, this is a collection of five single-storey buildings surrounding a central courtyard connected by covered walkways and verandahs, purpose built for the Aboriginal and Islander College of Music. The building is constructed in rendered brickwork and has a curved Colorbond steel roof and Aluminium framed windows. Salvaged pine power poles have been used to support undulating verandahs and walkways. This building is in excellent condition).

13.3 COMPARATIVE INFORMATION

Main building

This building was designed by Michael Cavanagh in 1901. Cavanagh had also designed the Convent of Mercy Bunbury and *St Brigids Convent*, Northbridge in 1897 using similar designs to that of the Clontarf building. The firm Cavanagh and Cavanagh designed a number of convents, churches and educational buildings in connection with the Roman Catholic Church.⁹²

The Convent of the Good Shepherd, West Leederville (Dennehy, 1903), Methodist Ladies College, Claremont (Hine 1907/8) are similar buildings in design and purpose by different architects of the period.

The Clontarf building is a good example of the style and of Cavanagh's work.

Chapel

This building was designed by Marie Jackson in 1940. Jackson (later Harding), born in 1917, was indentured to Reginald Summerhayes from 3 January 1937

 ⁹² Allom Lovell Hocking, op.cit.
Register of Heritage Places - Assessment Doc'n 14/12/2001

for at least 3 years. She was a registered architect from 1949 – 1952.⁹³ The Inter-War Romanesque style was used by E.LeB. Henderson for St Columba's Roman Catholic Church (South Perth, 1936) and by G. H. Parry for St Peter's Anglican Church (Victoria Park, 1935).⁹⁴

It remains a good example of this style.

1935-41 buildings

These buildings could loosely be described as Inter-War Mediterranean having some general characteristics such as roof pitch, wall massing, domestic scale and the inclusion of towers "reminiscent of Tuscany" as suggested in Apperly et al's caption for illustration of the crematorium at Rookwood Cemetery NSW.⁹⁵ However none of the other examples show towers and it is not a key characteristic of the style. Towers were however used on Bunbury High School (Hardwick, 1921), Heathcote Hospital (Tait, 1926-9), Loretto Convent Chapel (Summerhayes, c.1938) and the chapel at Santa Maria Convent (Henderson, 1956), so they have precedent use in educational, institutional and religious buildings.

The Mediterranean and Spanish styles were popular in Perth, Sydney and Canberra. Key practitioners of the 1920's to 1940's include Rodney Alsop and Marshall Clifton.⁹⁶

Clontarf vs Other Christian Brothers Institutions

Aquinas 1938 – educational

The main building at Aquinas, whilst having some similar features to the main building at Clontarf is Inter-War Gothic in style. Its layout and massing present a quite different approach to site development.

Castledare 1929 - intellectually handicapped and later junior orphanage

In 1934. Castledare changed from a home for intellectually handicapped children to a junior orphanage. The buildings at Castledare are quite different to those at Clontarf. The only surviving building from the *Castledare Boys' Home* is the original farm homestead, 'Niana', which is currently being restored.

Tardun 1920s – farm school

The main building at Tardun was apparently designed by Monsignor John C. Hawes but simplified during its construction. It is similar in layout to Clontarf's main building although on a larger scale and it has some Romanesque detailing.

Keaney College Bindoon 1936 - farm and trade school

Established in 1936, Bindoon was a modest development when Brother Keaney transferred there in 1942 when the RAAF took over Clontarf. This site is again demonstrative of the achievements of the staff and students and shows the continuing influence of Brother Keaney on building layout and design. The buildings at Bindoon are generally grander than those at *Clontarf.* Bindoon has buildings designed by Monsignor John. C. Hawes (1941 and 1943) and Dom Urbano (1944-53 and 1948-53).

Register of Heritage Places - Assessment Doc'n

⁹³ Willis, Julie, *Biographies of Women in Western Australian Architecture 1920-1960,* draft manuscript 1999.

⁹⁴ Allom Lovell Hocking, op.cit.

⁹⁵ Apperly et al, op.cit., p.173.

⁹⁶ Apperly et al, op.cit., p.172; Allom Lovell Hocking, op.cit..

Other Comparable Places

New Norcia 1846 – mission, orphanage

Buildings at New Norcia have both classical and Spanish influences. New Norcia's handball courts are very similar to the court constructed at the west end of Clontarf's 1938 classroom block.

Fairbridge 1913 – farm school, child migrants

The buildings at Fairbridge are dissimilar to those at Clontarf.

13.4 REFERENCES

Clontarf: Conservation Management Plan [Draft], prepared by Allom Lovell Hocking Conservation Consultants, for the Provincialate of Christian Brothers, October 1998.

Further Reading relating to the Christian Brothers and Child Migration Schemes:

Bro. P. Grant, *Boys' Town to Keaney College: 1936-1986*, Christian Brothers, Perth, 1986.

Phillip Bean and Joy Melville, *Lost Children of the Empire*, Unwin Hyman, London, 1989.

L.P. Welsh, Geordie; Orphan of the Empire, P&B Press, Como, WA 1990.

L.P. Welsh, *The Bindoon File*, P&B Press, Perth, WA, 1990.

Coldrey, Barry M, *The Scheme: The Christian Brothers and Childcare in Western Australia*, Argyle Pacific Publishing, Perth, 1993.

Margaret Humphries, Empty Cradles, Doubleday, London, c.1994.

Kate Davies, *When Innocence Trembles*, Angus & Robertson, Pymble, NSW, 1994.

Alan Gill, Orphans of the Empire: the shocking story of Child Migration to Australia, Millenium Books, Alexandrie, 1997.

Bruce Blyth, In the Shadow of the Cross, P&B Press, Como, 1997.

Bruce Blyth, Counting the Cost: Christian Brothers & Child Care in Australian Orphanages, P&B Press, Como, 1999.

13.5 FURTHER RESEARCH

The *Clontarf* annals from 1895 – 1941 not examined for the Allom Lovell Hocking report are now available for inspection at the Christian Brothers' Archives at 'Westcourt', Salter Point, WA.

National Archives of Australia, Victoria Park would reveal further information on the period of occupation by RAAF.